esid | Effective States and
Inclusive Development

identifying routes to social justice

ESID Working Paper No. 13

Gendered Politics of Securing Inclusive Development

Sohela Nazneen[1] and Simeen Mahmud[2]

September, 2012

[1]Associate Professor, Department of International Relations, University of Dhaka; sohela.nazneen@gmail.com

[2]Co-ordinator, Center for Gender and Social Transformation, BRAC Development Institute, BRAC University; simeen@bracu.ac.bd

Abstract

Political settlement frameworks are gender blind. In this paper, we interrogate the nature of gendered political settlements through analyzing selected country cases studies of the gendered nature of political and policy-making processes and identifying the different contextual and structural factors that promote gender inclusive development policies and outcomes. These factors include: elite support for a gender equity agenda; ability of the women's movement to contain oppositional elite or non elite groups; transnational discourse and actors creating space for the gender equity agenda; presence of male allies and 'femocrats' within the state apparatus; and policy coalitions exerting pressure on the state. The political opportunity structure and the history of how women's political entitlement was established influence the dynamics between these factors. Based on this analysis, we argue that a political settlement framework stands to gain from using a gender lens as it allows for exploration of the role played by (gendered) ideas, (gender) ideology, informal relations, policy coalitions, bottom-up strategies in how settlements are reached and sustained. The challenge is whether the parameters of PS can be expanded.

Keywords

political settlement, inclusive development, gendered politics, gendered policy process, women's representation, political inclusion, political participation, transnational actors, gender equity, women's interests

Acknowledgements

Table of Contents

4.2.4 Inclusion to Influencing: political (and other) conditions that enable integration of gender equity concerns into policy decision making processes?

Section 5: Conclusions

References

Annex
Annex 1: Elements of Political Settlement
Annex 2: Policy Process Case Study Matrix Analyzed Using a Political Settlement Lens
Annex 3: From Inclusion to Influence: Domestic Violence Law Change in South Africa
Annex 4: Matrix on empirical case studies for gendered political process and institutions
Annex 5: Matrix on empirical case studies for gendered policy processes

List of Tables
Table 3.1 Dimensions of Women's Political Effectiveness
Table 3.2 Case Study Selection Matrix
Table 4.1 Women in Formal Politics in Selected Case study Countries in SA and SSA
Table 4.2 Factors that Enable Women's Participation and Representation in Political Processes and Institutions
Table 4.3 Factors that Enable to Move from Inclusion to Influencing

Acronyms

ANC	African National Congress
DAWN	Development Alternatives with Women in New Era
DRC	Development Research Center
ESID	Effective States and Inclusive Development
GAD	Gender and Development
HDI	Human Development Index
ICPD	International Conference on Population and Development
IDRC	International Development Research Center
IFI	International Financial Institution
ILO	International Labour Organisation
NRM	National Resistance Movement
PoA	Plan of Action
PFA	Platform for Action
RPF	Rwandan Patriotic Front
SA	South Asia
SERNAM	Servicio Nacional de la Mujer
SSA	Sub Saharan Africa
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNIFEM	United Nations Development Fund for Women
UNRISD	United Nations Research Institute for Social Development
WID	Women in Development

Executive Summary

Political settlement (PS) frameworks and concepts do not focus on how women may participate in negotiating different political settlements or how different types of settlements influence and incorporate the way women's interests are interpreted. Feminist scholars so far, have not engaged with the concept of political settlement and developed a gendered analysis. However, exploring different bodies of literature, such as feminist analysis of representative democracy, feminist analysis of the state, gender analysis of policy-making processes, feminist organizational analysis, historical analysis of state welfare policies and their gender impact, allows us to interrogate the gendered nature and impact of political settlements.

We focused on two areas: i) gendered politics of women in political processes (participation and representation in formal/ informal institutions and through movements); ii) gendered politics of policy making; and what kind of outcomes for women results from these two processes. We explored these questions using countries from South Asia and Sub Saharan Africa where ESID plans to conduct its work. We employed a common framework which focuses on women's access, presence and influence in formal and informal spaces (in civil society/ formal politics/ state).

Through our *post hoc* country case studies we found that gender inclusive development is influenced by different factors including: i) elite support for women's inclusion/ gender equitable outcomes; ii) policy coalitions exerting pressure on state/elite actors; iii) male allies presence in state bureaucracy, civil society space, and the state; iv) presence of femocrats/women politicians to advocate a gender agenda; v) strength of women's movement to negotiate with elite/ oppositional elite/non elite groups on gender equity; vi) supportive transnational actors/discourses and context, which creates space for promoting a gender equity agenda. The dynamics between the above factors depend on political opportunity structures (McAdam, et al., 2001) and the role played by women during state formation/ periods of crisis (which creates political entitlements).

Based on our analysis we argue that the political settlement (PS) framework could expand our understanding of women's inclusion in political settlement as a group in the following manner. First, PS perspective focuses on agency and structure and interactions between both, which allows us to explore how women behave as actors or negotiate their interests, and also the gendered structures within which women (and other actors) operate and what kind of subsequent outcome results from these interactions. This framework allows us to map out the different players and actors who may promote or oppose gender equity interests in a particular policy area, or in matters of redistribution and also to identify the interests, incentives, nature of relationship, and ideas these actors have about women. This understanding unpacks the nature of the relationships that exist between different actors and that lead to particular forms of policies and gender outcomes. A PS framework is also effective for exploring the role played by policy coalitions, the significance of informal relations and intra-elite bargaining around gender equity concerns. Second, feminists have largely focused on the problem of women's representation by highlighting the limits of representative democracy, particularly debating the problems that arise in trying to promote gender equity interests given that women are not a homogenous group. There are fewer studies on when, how and where women become an important constituency for the political and policy elites and also how women challenge the existing political settlement in particular sectors/ policy areas;. These issues can be investigated through this lens. Third, the majority of the Gender and Development (GAD) literature has explored the effectiveness of gender quotas in promoting women's concerns but few studies focus on which women

benefit from these quotas and also on women in formal political parties. The PS framework may be used for nuanced analysis of the links between the politics of inclusion and the politics of influence, particularly exploring how and when women (and men) in different contexts and political opportunity structures become critical actors for promoting gender equity. Fourth, a PS framework is also effective for tracing how women initially gain inclusion in politics (during moments of state formation) and what kind of political entitlements result from the different forms of inclusion. Fifth, a PS lens helps to unpack the gender impact of clientelist politics, exploring how women as political actors (as politicians, policy makers, service recipients) negotiate clientelist politics and the gender impact of these negotiations.

We also argue that political settlements analysis stands to gain from including a gender lens. A gender lens clearly demonstrates the role played by ideologies and ideas. Gender ideologies of elites, excluded elites, oppositional elites and non elite groups influence how women's needs and interests are interpreted. This focus moves PS beyond its rational-choice base and its focus on incentive and interests and brings in the discursive elements. This has relevance for understanding how other marginalized groups (and those who claim to represent them) may propose alternative interpretations of inclusive development and how these are negotiated. In addition, a gender analysis of how political settlements are achieved and sustained around women's interests and gender equity concerns allows for exploring actions by non-elites, and the use of bottom up strategies by these groups and how participation at the local level may be influenced by national/ international actors and discourses.

Future research areas and methodologies for researching gender, inclusive development and political settlements may include a number of elements that are outlined here. First, the role played by policy coalitions to change the gendered nature of political settlements around specific policy areas/ sectors such as education, health, social protection, welfare, labor. The focus here would be on strategies used by different groups, and not only feminists/ or women's groups, for negotiating these issues. These can be researched through comparative sectoral studies, either in a single country case, or through comparative country cases. Second, the majority of the research on gender and clientelist politics has explored the impact on women of patronage-based politics and corruption in different state service sectors. A PS lens can help unpack the gender impact of clientelist and patronage-based politics exploring women's representation in politics, policy making and outcome that results in these contexts in single country cases; comparative country cases may further our understanding. Gendered accountability failures in these contexts can be explored through cross-sectoral comparative studies in single country cases/ or comparative country cases. Third, the links between the different forms of women's inclusion into politics leading to different kinds of politics influence and gendered policy/development outcomes may be studied through historical analysis within a single country case and extended into comparative cases once a template identifying critical factors has been developed. Methods may include in-depth interviews with representatives, case studies, and also quantitative methods for profiling the representatives. Fourth, for analyzing the nature of gendered settlements, how women's political entitlements as a collective group which were gained through their participation in politics during state formation or key moments of change lead to different types of policy outcomes can also be traced through historical analysis of single countries or comparative country cases using key informant interviews, archival analysis and document analysis. Fifth, the role played by transnational actors/ and discourses in creating space for the gender agenda and influencing the nature of gendered political settlements can be explored using case studies in particular sectors/ policy areas.

However, researching these would require addressing various challenges. A key point of debate is whether PS framework is able to effectively expand its parameters and incorporate the following: (gender) ideology, (gender) discourses, bottom up strategies used in negotiations by non-elite; the informal interactions? Another challenge is: given the context specificity of the gendered nature and impact of political settlements, will single country cases allow us to develop templates that may allow us to move on to conduct comparative case studies?

1. Introduction

1.1 Why explore the gendered politics of securing inclusive development?

This review aims to explore the gendered politics of securing inclusive development by investigating two interlinked areas: a) the gendered nature of policy processes and how they promote or hinder gender equitable outcomes; b) the gendered nature of politics[1] and how this promotes or constrains women's participation and inclusion in decision making and affects policy outcomes. It does not aim to prescribe policy recommendations but to identify future research agenda on political settlements and gender. Gender is at the core of securing inclusive development. Women's right to equality with men is accepted and promoted by many states and development agencies in development planning and policies. Yet enabling women's representation, participation and voice in politics and policy processes and achieving gender equitable outcomes for women has proven difficult (Goetz and Nyamu-Musembi, 2008; Mukhopadhay and Singh, 2007; UN/UNRISD, 2005). Understanding how women's 'political effectiveness'[2] in politics and policy making can be enhanced so as to ensure gender inclusive development requires a deeper analysis of: a) what enhances women's individual/ collective political agency; and b) the influence of structural factors that enhance/constrain women's agency such as the nature of the state; political competition, relationship between women's movements and civil society etc. The analysis also needs to take into account: a) the divergent interests and incentives political and state actors may have in promoting/ obstructing women's participation and the gender equity agenda in politics and policy processes; b) the local, national and international contexts that create opportunity structures for promotion of gender equity by these actors (including women policy makers and women's groups); c) how these actors (including women policy makers and women's groups) negotiate around these issues; d) the competing discourses on gender equity that may create opportunities for, or limit promotion of, gender equity in different forums.

An analysis of gendered policy processes and the gendered nature of politics in different political contexts may help to unpack: a) how states and elites in different political contexts perceive women as a development/ political constituency, interpret women's needs and gender equity concerns, and how their interpretations influence policy outcomes; b) how the above interpretations are challenged and at times expanded by the women (and their allies) in formal politics and through social movements/ organized activism for securing inclusive outcomes (i.e., 'politics beyond boundaries' Squires, 2004). Analysis of the above would help to interrogate the key concepts used by Effective States and Inclusive Development Research Centre (ESID)

---

[1] This largely refers to formal politics but we also look at social movement and activism, such as the role of women's movement and collective action by women.
[2] See section 3.1.

in studying politics such as political settlements, social contracts,[3] women's/ group interests,[4] from a gender lens. By exploring the gendered nature of politics and policy processes we will examine different elements of political settlement through a gender lens (Annex 1) and draw conclusions on whether using a gender perspective deepens our understanding of the political settlements.

1.2 Key questions

In order to explore the two interlinked areas: gendered politics and policy processes and how they promote or hinder gender equitable inclusive development the paper asks the following questions:

a) How does a commitment to a gender equity approach become embedded in government policy, from inception through to the implementation of particular interventions? What are the political (and other) conditions that enable this?

b) What are the politics that enable the achievement of/significant moves towards gender equity in political processes and institutions (with a particular focus on representation and participation)?

c) Is there any evidence of gendered concerns being integrated within political settlements or at key moments of state formation?

d) How can the shift from inclusion to influence be achieved with regards women's participation in political and policy-making processes?

e) What role do women's movements and coalitions play in this process? Which strategies and tactics are most successful in which contexts, and how these can be further enabled?[5]

1.3 Scope

Feminist historians and political scientists have explored how colonial states and later on the Third World states have reinforced patriarchal notions of gender through their social policies and programs which influence gender identities and relationships. There is a plethora of research, largely conducted from the 1980s onwards, on women in formal politics and the women's movement (nature, types, diversity within the movement) in developing countries. However, literature which provides a gender analysis or a feminist analysis of political settlement in the developing countries is nonexistent. [6] In order to address this gap and to investigate the questions set out above, we selectively review the following bodies of literature. By reviewing these different bodies we highlight the existing links between them for interrogating political settlement from a feminist perspective in developing countries.

---

[3] Pateman (1988) uses the concept sexual contract to explore the exclusion of women as a group as party to the social contract between man and the state.
[4] See Jones and Jonasdottir (1989) for discussion on the role played by subjective experience in interest identification and formation.
[5] We are not suggesting that women's movements are the only force at work to promote gender equity. Women's presence and influence in other arenas and movements matter (see Goetz and Hassim's framework in section 3.1).
[6] None that the authors have come across, but we may be wrong.

The bodies of literature that are broadly covered are:

a) feminist analysis of liberal representative democracy, which includes both conceptual and theoretical literature[7] and case studies of developing countries on women's representation and participation in formal politics[8];

b) feminist analyses of the state[9], including the post colonial state,[10] particularly focusing on gendered outcome of state policies in the developing country context;

c) institutional analysis of how gender bias exists in development organizations including state bureaucracies (how this influences the way gender interests are conceptualized and interpreted, the kinds of mechanisms that are created for addressing these interests and ensuring accountability); [11]

d) case studies on gender analysis of policy-making processes, particularly gender mainstreaming in state program and policies in developing countries;[12]

f) case studies on the feminist movement, women's movement and women's collective action for securing gender equitable goals and outcomes in development and what strategies work in which context;

h) historical analysis of social policy-making processes, particularly welfare and policies on addressing care economy, in the developed states;[13]

i) case studies on how women are included in formal institutions in the transitional contexts and their policy impact;[14]

j) selected literature on political settlement.

1.4 Challenges and limitations

The discussion in this review largely centers on case studies of specific policy processes or interventions to ensure women's representation and participation in formal politics and policy processes and their resulting outcome. While analysis of these case studies allows us to draw insights on the different political contexts where these interventions and policy processes unfold, it also has the following limitations.

First, the selection of cases (see explanation below) is mainly based on (but not limited to) geographical areas where the Research Program Consortium on Effective States and

---

[7] E.g. Phillips (1991, 1995); Young (1990).

[8] E.g. Waylen (1996); Goetz and Hassim (2003).

[9] E.g. Randall and Waylen (1998).

[10] E.g. Rai and Lievesley (1996). They point out that the state's role is contradictory. State-promoted gender equity as a part of the modernization/nation building project (women were granted the vote; women's access to education increased; welfare policies for poor women continued etc). However, it has also sustained male privilege, especially when it came to family law reforms (some changes were made; see the Hindu family code being reformed in 1956 or the Muslim Family Law Ordinance in Pakistan in 1961; however, these reforms were limited and family laws of minority groups remained unchanged and gender biased. See Waylen (1996), Rai (1996) etc.

[11] E.g. Staudt (1990); Goetz (1997a).

[12] E.g., Mukhopadhyay and Singh (2007).

[13] E.g., Skocpol (1992); Okin (1979). Undeniably, the post colonial state in South Asia and Sub Saharan Africa differs from the developed country context when it comes to reflect on political settlement from a gender perspective.

[14] The focus is not on the post conflict scenario, but that it is during these stages of state formation that gender issues are addressed /included or not which allows us to reflect on the case of developing countries in South Asia and Sub Saharan Africa. See Molyneux (1985); Tamang (2004).

Inclusive Development (ESID) plans to conduct its research. This selection of cases is also influenced by the sectors that ESID plans to research. Both of these imply the possibility that other cases more pertinent to our review may have been overlooked. (We have tried to mitigate this by ensuring a good geographical spread and including cases from other regions).

Second, many of the secondary literature on policy processes and state bureaucracies focuses on the 'traditional' sectors where gender equity concerns are relatively easier to identify, such as reproductive health, education etc. This then leaves out those sectors which are notorious for being gender biased, such as energy, transport, etc. and that have a very significant gender impact.

Third, a large part of the gender and development case studies on policy process comes from analyzing gender mainstreaming in different sectors. The challenge would be to draw conclusions on political context from these micro level studies of policy processes. Similarly a large part of the feminist literature deals with formal politics, particularly interventions such as quotas for ensuring women's representation. A challenge would be to find cases that move beyond the quotas and focus on other mechanisms for ensuring women's representation. This implies that we may need to focus on the local, particularly various participatory processes that allow citizen's inclusion.[15]

Fourth, the lack of literature on feminist analysis of political settlement in developing countries poses a major challenge. As mentioned above, using cases of political analysis of social policy processes in the developed countries for unpacking political settlement may be questioned by people who would argue that the political context of post colonial states are very different from that of the developed states (Rai, 1996).

Fifth, feminist analysis of the state, institutions, politics, and representation is effective for unpacking gender biases in politics. However many of these analysis do not provide alternative ways to make politics gender equitable. Many of the interventions which the selected case studies analyze, such as quotas for women in politics or creation of gender machineries for including gender equity concerns in state policies, etc, have been critiqued for their limited impact. Given the above scenario, this review may have limited discussion on practical measures that ensures gender equitable outcomes in politics and policy making.

Finally, as we focus on analyzing our cases we have had to limit our gender analysis to several roles played by women: as state service users, policy makers, bureaucrats, politicians, and women's rights activists. We focus on which structural factors enhance or constrain their agency in these roles. We also focus on how structural factors construct their needs and interests. This particular lens in understanding women's role may have limited our analysis to what works, how and why, focusing largely on incentives and interests of different actors. We have not focused on gender ideologies and discourses, which play important roles in constructing how women's needs and interests are interpreted by different actors. In addition, although we are doing a gender analysis of politics we have largely and deliberately left men out. The reason why the spotlight has to be on women is because of the continued significance of women's subordination in social relations and institutions across the developing world, even in societies that have loose forms of patriarchy (Vietnam, Brazil)[16], realizing that

---

[15] Case studies from Citizenship DRC; also studies from the Future State DRC—but these may not necessarily have a gender focus.

[16] See Momsen and Townsend (1987).

male dominated cultures can also be quite destructive and oppressive for some men. Section 3 discusses how we tried to mitigate this situation.

1.5 Definitions

This paper uses the following definitions and makes the following assumptions about how gender is linked with the key concepts:

a) Political settlements: Political settlements refer to a balance of power between contending social groups and classes upon which the state is based (Di John and Putzel, 2009). Political settlement includes intra elite bargaining, contention between elite and non-elite groups, inter-group contention (gender, caste, race, religious, ethnic etc). We assume that because this concept emphasizes the role of the elites, it takes a top down approach to understanding the development process hence it inherits the gender hierarchies and biases embedded in all social arrangements and institutions.

b) Gender equity: Gender equity takes into account that men and women have different needs, interests and preferences and may require difference in treatments for ensuring equal outcomes (Goetz and Jenkins, 2005).

c) Women's interests: Women interests include both gender and gender equity interests. Gender interests or practical gender interests refer to those interests of women have in order to fulfill their social roles as women. Strategic gender interests are interests derived from an analysis of inequality based on gender differences, and aim for a lasting change in gender power relations (Molyneux, 1985). Both practical and strategic gender interests are interconnected, how women's practical gender interests are addressed (by women themselves and other actors) may lead to promotion of strategic gender interests of women (Moser, 1989). We recognize that the dichotomy between strategic and practical gender needs and interests is not always useful as they overlap. Women's interests are mediated by their class, race, ethnicity, caste, religious identity (Menon, 2000) which make it difficult for women themselves, political representatives and policy makers to address practical gender interests and strategic interests through development program and in policy processes. However, we use these as tools for exploring if and when gender equity concerns may have been promoted in politics and policy processes.

1.6 Major conclusions

Through our discussions on different country cases in this paper we aimed to explore how the gendered nature of women's inclusion, participation and influence in politics and policy processes furthers our understanding of political settlements and inclusive development.

Our *post hoc* analysis of different cases in sections 4.1 and 4.2 shows how incentives and interests of different political or social actors and the nature of the formal political institutions and policy processes influence gender inclusive development. The

role and influence of elites, state, non-state, transnational actors (including international women's movement), institutional structures, gender ideology in promoting women's inclusion and participation in formal politics, collective movements and policy processes vary across different contexts and historical junctures. The factors that influenced women's inclusion in politics and policy spaces leading to influence in promoting gender equitable policy outcomes across cases were: a) elite support for women's inclusion and gender equity; b) policy coalitions exerting pressure on political elites and the state and negotiating gender equitable outcomes; c) presence of male allies within the state bureaucracy, civil society and policy spaces; d) femocrats and women politicians willing to advocate the gender agenda; e) strength of women's movements in raising demands and resisting other elite/ non-elite actors opposing gender equity; f) supportive transnational actors creating space for, and pressure on, the political elite and the state for promotion of gender equity; g) transnational gender discourses creating legitimacy and space for women's demands (see sections 4.1.6 ,4.2, tables 4.2 and 4.3). The dynamics between these factors listed above and the influence of these in delivering gender inclusive development were mediated by existing 'political opportunity structure'[17] (McAdam et al., 2001), and women's roles during critical junctures of state formation/ crisis periods (i.e., anti colonial struggle, independence struggle, revolutionary upheaval etc) which influenced perceptions around their political entitlements (i.e., women's claim on inclusion in political and policy spaces and focus on gender equitable outcomes). The range of actors that are identified through our *post hoc* analysis provides us with a list of factors that are elements of political settlements (see annex 1) and can be investigated further to deepen our understanding of the links between politics of inclusion and the politics of influence, thus gendered nature and impact of political settlements.

Our analysis of these different country cases also demonstrates the importance of the role of informal relations between intra elite groups/ and elite and non-elite actors, bottom-up movements, informal institutions, ideology and ideas that shape whether development is gender inclusive (sections 4.1.4, 4.1.5, 4.1.6, and conclusion of 4.2). Some of these aspects are less emphasized in the current analysis of political settlement and using a gender lens will deepen our understanding of political settlements. We also argue in section five that feminist debates on the gendered nature of politics and policy processes can be enhanced through a political settlement perspective as it draws attention to gaps in feminist literature, such as which women are a part of formal political parties and how they negotiate with different constituencies, the gender impact of clientelist politics.[18] A political settlement perspective allows for systematic, context specific and historical analysis of how gender inclusive development is negotiated between different social and political actors, where centers of power may lie, and how power relations shift leading to different gender policy outcomes (see section 5). This

---

[17] This includes the relative openness or closure of the institutionalized political system, the stability of the elite alignments, the presence of elite allies, the state's capacity and propensity for repression (based on McAdam et al., 2001).

[18] We do not suggest that these aspects have not been researched in feminist literature. For example, Goetz (2003), Goetz (2007), UNIFEM (2008) discuss the impact of patronage and corruption on women in politics and also service delivery. However, there is room for exploring how women as political actors (both politicians, policy makers, service recipients) negotiate clientelist politics and the gender impact of these negotiations. Policy processes have been extensively analyzed by feminists and others, focusing on how gender interests and equity are addressed. We are referring to a focus on strategies used not only by feminist coalitions, but larger coalitions, and trying to derive an analysis that takes actor's agency, structure and also the discursive elements into account.

scope for tracing nuanced analysis would add to and enrich the feminist body of knowledge.

1.7 Structure of the paper

This paper has five sections. The next section provides the definitions we use in this paper and also a brief background that highlights the limitations of gender mainstreaming processes in the developing world, which is useful for contextualizing the gendered policy process. It also provides a brief section on the gender biased assumptions that exist in liberal political theory. The third section discusses the methodology used for selecting case studies and the analytical framework used in this paper. The fourth section is on gendered politics of securing inclusive development. The first subsection explores women's representation and participation in political processes and institutions. It analyzes women women's representation in elected bodies and state bureaucracies, consultative processes; interest representation through women's movement, and other social movements and what enables effective representation. It draws conclusions on what type of politics enables shift towards gender equity in political processes and institutions. The next sub section analyses gendered policy processes which explores three policy areas and what factors enabled gender equitable outcomes. The last section draws conclusions from these discussions and comments on research gaps, further areas of enquiry and relevance of using political settlement for understanding gender inclusive development.

2. Background

2.1. Setting the context: limitations of gender mainstreaming

2.1.1 The politics of the discourse around gender and development policy

After a millennium for men, we got a decade for women. (Participant at the Women's Studies Conference, London 1991, cited in Kabeer 1994, pp: 1).

The gender and development arena has always been politically contentious because it confronts the basis of social organization in any society, that of the relationship between women and men. It has emerged and evolved through a difficult, at times hostile, relationship between the international development agencies (mostly UN agencies and international financial institutions) and feminist scholars and activists. The story of this evolution is well documented and familiar to feminist advocates and scholars in the North and South, but might be worth reviewing for the general development establishment, and in particular for those engaged in macro-economic and poverty reduction policy making.

Although under certain political contexts women's inclusion in political institutions came about from their active participation in fairly large numbers in anti colonial, anti authoritarian and anti apartheid struggles, their 'political entitlements' (Agarwal, 2011) led to mixed outcomes with respect to women's inclusion into policy processes (see section 4.1.6, 4.2.4 and tables 4.1, 4.2, 4.3). In India (1930s) this entitlement was confined to reserved membership in the legislature and party membership; in Chile (1990s), despite the establishment of an effective national gender machinery, SERNAM, it failed to enable women's greater inclusion into public policy spaces; in South Africa (1990s) women entered policy spaces and were effective in including women's interests in the policy agenda but there were huge accountability failures in implementation.

Within the development community more generally, however, women first emerged as a distinct constituency in development efforts in the 1970s with the advent of Boserup's path-breaking book 'Women's Role in Economic Development', which demonstrated how conventional development activities had bypassed women and the 'fruits of development were not trickling down to women'. It was through this critique and the subsequent efforts of early women in development (WID) advocates and scholars that the hitherto unacknowledged but powerful assumption of development planners and policy makers about women's family responsibilities and tasks and the subsequent promotion of their domestic roles in development policy became exposed[19]. This was instrumental in shifting the earlier view of women as dependents on men and passive recipients of welfare[20] to the view of women as economic producers who contribute to household and country economies on an 'equal' footing with men.

Within official development agencies however the new focus on women soon became linked with poverty reduction and basic needs in which women were cast as 'managers of low income households and providers of family basic needs' (Kabeer 1994, pp:7), retaining a comfortable link with their responsibilities for family and child welfare. This approach carried little possibility of bringing about any real change in unequal gender relations since it failed to define women's problems in terms of unequal access to resources. In the late 1970s, some feminists[21] began to distance themselves from this approach, and began to problematize social and gender relations in developing countries and to question the positivist models of development interventions: education and training, employment, agricultural technological change, etc. (Jackson and Pearson 1998, pp:3). They explicitly rejected the view presented by the dominant and growing development literature of women as a separate but homogenous category. They emphasized that relations between men and women are social and therefore not immutable. In any historical situation, the form taken by gender relations is specific to that context and needs to be constructed inductively. Gender relations it cannot be read off from other social relations or from the gender relations of other societies (Jackson and Pearson 1998).

During the 1980s the efficiency argument of WID policy was reinforced by emphasizing women as economic agents in their own rights, who were not only bypassed by development policy, but making the converse point that women's exclusion would have an adverse impact on development and neglecting women's productivity would be costly on the part of planners. But such recognition coincided with the shift in the approach of the International Financial Institutions (IFI) (World Bank, IMF) to development itself, in which the role of the government as a development agency was required to be curtailed to meet the objectives of fiscal austerity, and reduce balance of payments deficits and domestic government deficits. The many activities previously carried out by governments (transport, communications, tertiary health care, higher education) were to be privatized and social services (most closely connected to

---

[19] Boserup (1970) first made the strong case for women's productive roles, and she argued that post colonial governments had systematically bypassed women in their diffusion of new technologies, inputs and services.

[20] Development resources would be directed to market oriented economic growth and the residual would be welfare assistance for the dependent and vulnerable groups (Kabeer 1994, pp: 6).

[21] A group of feminist scholars, the Subordination of Women Collective, based at IDS, Sussex University (Jackson and Pearson 1998, pp: 1).

reproductive activities) would be reorganized and not-for-profit non-governmental organizations (NGO) would take on many of those functions.

The dominant development models also assumed that improvement in human wellbeing including women's wellbeing would not be possible without economic growth; in fact economic growth was seen as synonymous with development. Kabeer (1994) and others diagnosed this as confusing means and ends but with a political agenda that "allowed more attention to be paid to the rate of economic growth than to its pattern" (Kabeer 1994, pp: 75), postponing redistributive measures and policies to redress inequality, with serious implications for gender equality. At the same time the tendency to frame gender equity concerns at national levels on instrumental arguments (in terms of social and economic gains for development) ran the risk of overlooking concerns with gender justice and women's citizenship entitlements. Feminists pointed out the hidden 'gender trap' (Kabeer 1994, pp: 26) within the market solution: increased monetary costs of welfare services and of health and education services, increased reliance on women's unpaid care work, women's entrance into informal unprotected low-paid casual labor to supplement dwindling household incomes (Kabeer, 1994; Goetz, 1995; Molyneux and Razavi, 2006).

On the other hand, this new scenario opened up space for women's organizations and particularly the creation of women's NGOs, which were believed to be more responsive to the needs of people at the grassroots level (Jackson and Pearson, 1998). Around this time Third World feminists also began raising concerns that economic growth oriented development was overlooking the needs and aspirations of poor women in those countries. Feminist voices from the South also countered the WID assumption that it was the prejudice of planners that was primarily responsible for women's marginalization from the development process, and critiqued the absence of a deeper examination of structural factors that caused women's subordination in the development process (Razavi, 1997). They claimed that the clearest lens for understanding the problems of development processes was the lived experience of poor Third World women in their struggles for basic survival, arguing that alternative development strategies were needed and that women should be targeted as beneficiaries of these new organizations in order to gain access to international development funding (Sen and Grown, 1988). There was also criticism from them of the official language of gender mainstreaming that was adopted by the Beijing PFA[22], first because of its preoccupation with procedures rather than outcomes, and second because despite its roots in social feminism gender had become a technocratic term failing to address issues of power relations[23]. More significantly, the lack of accountability of international development agencies (UN bodies included) to the Southern women in whose interests they claim to be acting is not commonly seen as part of the gendered politics of development (see Baden and Goetz 1998, pp: 24).

By late 1990s faith in market solutions had waned and by 2000 there was growing realization about the fragility of an international order based on unregulated financial flows. There was what Molyneux (2002, cited in Molyneux and Razavi, 2006) describes a "new moment" in the development policy agenda of the IFIs: a willingness to pay greater attention to social policy and poverty reduction, good governance through democracy, participation and decentralization, but maintaining the core elements of trade and financial liberalization and tight monetary/fiscal policies (Molyneux and Razavi, 2006; Mukhopadhyay and Singh, 2007). The trade-off between growth and equity may

---

[22] Promoted within international development circles by Western gender policy advocates in bilateral agencies (Baden and Goetz 1998, pp: 20).
[23] Women activists from Pakistan, Philippines, Bangladesh, DAWN.

have become less clear cut, but has not disappeared, highlighting the need for greater attention to structures of global and local power and the evolution of gender injustices. The feminist critique of the 'poverty trap', that poverty analyses of policy are not necessarily adequate for addressing gender issues since women's subordination is not caused by poverty (Kabeer, 1994; Jackson, 1996), has also been clearly validated by assessments of the poverty reduction strategy (PRS) process passionately promoted by the IFIs since the late 1990s. Women's groups and rights activists have also been energetic on gaining recognition for the need to bring gender perspectives in forums discussing macro-economic policies and forging political alliances with governments, NGOs and social movements (Molyneux and Razavi, 2006).

Clearly, feminist critiques and activists in the North and South have been in the forefront of the discourse on gender and development, and the selective take up of gender concerns by the IFIs present useful insights into the politics of this discursive context. One such group were women active within international financial and development bureaucracies (like the World Bank, ILO, UNDP, etc) in getting women's interests and gender equality included into the development agendas of these agencies. Just as gender and development policy discourse has evolved and reshaped over time, feminist advocates have used diverse strategies and tactics to mobilize and influence development agendas within their respective organizations. Razavi (1997) describes the strategies women advocates adopted to fit gender into development institutions. She concludes that even in the face of persistent criticism from feminist scholars, the basic strategy of these transnational actors was to "make a range of instrumental arguments that link gender equality to more 'legitimate' policy concerns, market efficiency, growth and human resource development" to convince hardened bureaucrats (Razavi 1997, pp: 1111). These efforts culminated in a range of high visibility policy documents of the World Bank and UN bodies where gender mainstreaming was projected as a dominant theme in development policy[24]. Later, with the advent of the anti-poverty approach feminist policy advocates took advantage of the paradigm shift and resorted to emphasis on poor women, and poor men, to present the gender equality agenda as less threatening to male bureaucrats and program implementers. In the wake of structural adjustment another genre of feminist advocates engaged with mainstream economists in the development establishment using neoclassical efficiency argument: gender was introduced sometimes as a means for understanding the complexities of the adjustment process (i.e. intra-household allocations and inequalities and bargaining), and sometimes more politically to demonstrate how gender biases and rigidities can frustrate adjustment policies (Razavi 1997, pp: 1115). These accounts highlight the institutional constraints within which feminist advocates have to operate. They also point to the significance of those working outside the institutional context, namely citizen groups, feminist scholars, NGOs, who can take advantage of strategic entry points and more transformative discourse to influence the policy agenda.

2.1. 2 Bringing 'gender' back into development policy

The 1995 UN Conference on Women in Beijing was seen as a landmark in setting a global policy framework to advance gender equality, but ten years on achievements in gender equality were "more ambivalent and the causal influences more diverse and less unidirectional than is sometimes assumed" (Molyneux and Razavi,

---

[24] World Bank (1995) "Towards Gender Equality: The Role of Public Policy"; the World Bank "Enhancing Women's Participation in Development' (1994); the UNDP Human Development Report (1995).

2006, pp: iv). There was even a sense of betrayal that governments were indifferent and inactive, and had failed to turn the 'platform into action'[25]. Dominant development paradigms continued to equate development with economic growth and to assume that reductions in gender inequality in wellbeing have a linear relationship with development[26]. While some stark gender inequalities were reduced over time, others remain resistant to change or have even taken new forms. There is also considerable variation amongst countries with respect to reduction in gender inequality and no clear relationship is evident with the pace and level of human development (see Annex Table 1 on distribution of countries by HDI index and by gender inequality index). Structural adjustment of the 1980s and 1990s, particularly, left gender specific impacts and put the burden of economic reforms relatively more upon women in the poorest households. In fact, three decades of development policy dedicated to the single-minded pursuit of economic growth and the gender mainstreaming project has not delivered secure livelihoods and an 'enabling economic environment', which were considered preconditions for attaining gender equality and women's rights.

While the term gender has permeated through to national governments and policy-making institutions, southern feminists at Beijing asserted that the focus on gender rather than women had become counter-productive as it had allowed discussion to shift from "a focus on women, to women and men, and finally back to men[27] (Baden and Goetz 1998, pp: 21). In the new millennium there was growing disillusionment with gender mainstreaming for not fulfilling aspirations of social transformation and removal of persistent gender injustices and inequalities (UN/UNRISD, 2005; Mukhopadhyay and Singh, 2007). Evidence of rising adverse sex ratios, an indicator of the rigidity of embedded gender hierarchies and biases, in several countries (China, South Korea, India, most recently and Vietnam) confirms these perceptions, and demonstrates how things can go wrong even during a period of achievements in gender equality and economic growth.

By 2000 there was a 'wave of reassessment of gender mainstreaming', the mere closing or narrowing of gender gaps and equality in numbers were not enough to remove inequality in access to economic and political resources nor dismantle gender asymmetries that had infiltrated development policy and program design. Gender mainstreaming as the primary strategy for promoting and pursuing gender equity in and through development has lost credibility since concerns with 'gender equality' were not enough to provide 'redress' for ongoing gender injustices (Mukhopadhyay and Singh, 2007). Gender analysis had been reduced to technocratic discourse and gender mainstreaming via WID units had become a technical project, difficult to fit with the political project of challenging inequality and promoting women's rights and (Baden and Goetz, 1998; Mukhopadhyay and Singh, 2007). Feminist phrases and concepts for understanding women's position in the development process were co-opted by international development agencies and national governments and became filled with new meanings to suit institutional needs. Within international institutions gender mainstreaming practice faced continued bureaucratic resistance. A review[28] of gender mainstreaming policy implemented by the World Bank, UNDP and the ILO found inadequate budgeting for the gender component of projects, insufficient development of

---

[25] Molyneux and Razavi, 2006 on this.

[26] The World Bank claimed that countries with higher GDP had greater gender equality, implying that promotion of economic growth through liberalization was an important tool for closing gender gaps in well being (World Bank, 2001a).

[27] Nighat Khan Director Applied Socio Economic Research, Pakistan.

[28] See Razavi and Miller (1995).

analytical skills, and a general lack of political commitment, both within the organization, and at country level (Charlesworth 2005, pp: 11). Clearly, as Staudt (1997) pointed out in the early 1990s bureaucrats act in institutional and political contexts that are more often reproduced than transformed, and "We need to know more about men who dominate decision making in the bureaucracy and how they vary in diverse institutional settings" (Staudt 1997, pp:4).

On the positive side however, the fact that social policy, good governance, participation and decentralization are now high on the development policy agenda provides a critical moment to bring gender back into the discourse and practice in more meaningful and transformative ways. This moment has opened up the possibility of bringing to the foreground gender justice, rights and citizenship in the process of development, created entry points for action to address gender based injustices, new spaces for participation by poor people and by women to articulate and claim rights, and to raise voices against gender specific capacity and accountability failures on the part of the state and private sector. But the risk remains that claims of 'participation' and 'empowerment' are driven by gendered interests leaving the least powerful without voice or choice and of poor accountability to women's groups and constituencies (Cornwall, 2005).

2.2. Gender bias in liberal political theory and assumptions about change

Feminist literature extensively discusses how women have been excluded from formal politics and decision-making processes in liberal theory, based on assumptions that women lack the rationality required for democratic deliberation (Pateman, 1988; Okin, 1979). Consequently, women's exclusion had been linked to an absence of public deliberation on and from political agendas issues such as, child welfare, reproductive health, and domestic violence etc. Analysis of women's exclusion in liberal theory led to an intuitive conclusion that inclusion/ presence of women in electoral or decision making bodies would make a significant difference in drawing attention to these neglected issues (Dovi, 2006). Increased women's presence in public office was identified as a major pathway for promotion of gender equity concerns in policy making in both feminist and development literature (see section 4.1.3 for merits of this understanding). This led to the emphasis on women's/gender quotas, creation of women's/ gender machineries in gender and development discourse (Tadros, 2010; 2011). However, this linear connection made in development discourse between women's access (consultation in various citizen's/ policy forums and spaces) and presence (representation) in electoral/ decision making bodies leading to influence has been critiqued by many feminists (see Goetz and Nyamu-Musembi, 2008 for details). While women's representation and participation in political parties and policy places are necessary conditions for gender equitable outcomes, they alone are not sufficient.

3: Analytical framework and case study selection method

3.1 Analytical framework

For analyzing women's access, presence and influence in politics we chose to use the framework developed by Goetz and Hassim (2003). This allows us to explore these issues in three different spheres: the civil society arena, the formal political arena, and the state. By access they mean women's ability to enter the official and semi autonomous/ invited spaces in these arena; by presence they include numbers, visibility,

and participation by women in these three arenas; and by influence they mean women are able to make and change decisions and convince others to secure their interests. The framework not only allows us to focus on women's political agency but also the nature of the mechanisms and processes through which women participate and represent. We use this as a common analytical lens for examining selected cases on policy processes and interventions for ensuring women's participation. It allows us to explore how women's movements' access, presence and influence within the civil society sphere vary based on specific indicators such as, the depth of the movement, style of leadership, size and resources, etc; and draw conclusions on women's movement's political effectiveness. The framework also includes separate indicators for formal political systems, such as the nature of the electoral system, party types, reservations for women, nature of political competition etc., for analyzing political effectiveness of women's representation and participation. It also has similar indicators for analyzing women's political effectiveness when it comes to the state, such as the number of different forums that have quotas for women; nature of national women's machineries, constitutional framework of the state etc.

We are not suggesting that this is the only framework for studying gendered politics of securing inclusive development. A historical approach analyzing different cases that focused on how women gained political entitlements through participation in various anti-colonial or independence struggles and their resulting impact on their bargaining power and influence may have provided a more nuanced understanding of settlements in different contexts (see section 4.1.6). However, the Goetz and Hassim (2003) framework allows us to unpack women's inclusion and participation as actors or in institutional spaces which are identified as elements of political settlement (Annex 1) and develop a general picture of a country, identifying which actors are willing and in which spaces the agenda for gender inclusive development is promoted. In addition, this framework allows us to do the following: first, the analysis of women's 'political effectiveness' in different spheres presented in this framework can be used to interpret women's presence and influence among different elements of political settlement (see Annex 1); second, the concept of women's 'political effectiveness' (access , presence and influence) is useful for exploring how different actor's and institutions may negotiate over gender equitable outcomes in policy process, particularly whether women's inclusion leads to influence in policy outcomes (Annex 2). This framework is also useful for tracing the trajectory of where women are in politics and policy spaces in different country contexts.

Table 3.1: Dimensions of women's political effectiveness

Dimensions	The nature of civil society	The nature of political system and political competition	The nature of the state and its bureaucracy
Access (from barometric to decisive)	-Nature of women's movement (size, depth, breadth; resource) -Women in mainstream CSO and women's organizations (level and type of membership; access barriers to participation; quality of membership; mechanisms used to consult women members and women outside organizations about their needs and interests; mechanisms used to inform leaders about these)	-Party characteristics (ideology; recruitment and mentoring within the party; presence and power of women's wing; leadership selection process within the party; mobility—is it based on merit or patronage?) -Nature of political competition (Violence may limit women's access; so can the need for excessive campaign finance) -Consultative forums (how do parties generate information on voter's needs—women's needs?)	-Women's access to various consultative forums on policy processes -Parliamentary standing committee on women's rights -Decentralized government structure -Nature of consultative and participatory mechanisms available for women's participation
Presence (from numerical presence of women to strategic presence in terms of having policy leverage)	-Structure of women's movement (association's leadership structures; are they able to integrate with political parties? Or are they fluid organizations better at protests?) -Leadership within the movement (apprenticeship; selection method; nature of relationship with other social movement; state officials; parties)	-Nature of electoral system (proportional representation or first past the post system; open or closed lists. PR system works better in getting women in). -Reservations for women in parliament, local government; the nature of these quotas (separate constituency; direct election of women vs women nominated by electoral college/ parties. All of these effect whether quotas are effective)	-Affirmative action for women in state bureaucracy and ability of femocrats in promoting gender equity concerns -National women's machinery And their ability to co-ordinate and sanction various government departments on gender equity issues -Women in executive positions and their interest/ability to promote gender equity

			-Women in local government and their ability to promote gender equity
	-Proportion of women leaders and membership in other CSO	-Mandate for representing women's interests, gender equity issues -Political culture	
Influence (accountability to a gender equity constituency)	-Citizen's initiative to hold state to account (report cards; gender audits/social audit; public hearing etc—is women's interests presented here? How? Do they have power to hold official to account) -Accountability within the women's movement to constituencies -Are women's groups autonomous self help groups/ watchdogs/ survival network? -Are women's groups responsive to the grassroots membership? What about accountability to CSO funders?	-Electoral systems (who are women representatives accountable to) -Party type (is it centralized or decentralized; levels in institutionalization—is it based on patronage and informal decision making processes? Or is it rule based?) -Accountability systems in legislature: cross party women's caucus; standing committees on women's rights	-Constitutional framework: presidential versus parliamentary system; relative power of the executive to support women in politics; -Legal and regulatory framework (gender equity in family law; criminalization of abuses of women's rights, persecution of perpetrator of violence; resolution of contradictions between customary and civil law; gender sensitive legal systems (court, police etc) -Administrative capacity (independent civil bureaucracy to resist particular class, race, ethnic interest; transparency in decision making and budget; Incentive for frontline workers to promote gender equity; monitoring systems that reward promotion of gender equity -Budgetary transparency (women's budgets, gender audit of actual spending; women's sub groups taking decisions on spending at local level for funds earmarked for women; women's participation in targeting who are selected for benefits in anti-poverty programs etc)

Source: Goetz and Hassim (2003)

The main constraint of using this framework is that it is largely useful for analyzing formal and semi formal institutions and spaces. Women's participation in informal institutions, how traditional elites influence the way state and political parties promote gender equity or not, and bottom up mobilization by women and other groups for challenging existing settlement around gender equity are not made explicit within this framework. The role played by gender ideologies and ideas in shaping actor's perceptions (other than party ideology) is also not explicit in this framework. We have attempted to address these gaps within the framework through focusing on women's participation and inclusion in citizen's forums, informal spaces, women in grassroots/ bottom-up mobilization, and their involvement in policy spaces, and the role played by gender ideologies in shaping actor's perception (though the latter is not a key area of focus) in our case study analysis in sections 4.1.4, 4.1.5, 4.1.6, and 4.2.4.

3.2 Case study selection matrix

We use the following matrix to select our case study countries. As stated before, our selection largely focuses on countries in South Asia and Sub Saharan Africa where ESID aims to conduct its research. However, we have also included countries from Asia and Latin America to highlight some of the points we make about gendered politics of securing inclusive development.

	Geographical Regions		
Political context	South Asia	Sub Saharan Africa	Other regions
Post conflict/ revolution	Nepal	Rwanda	Egypt
Stable	Bangladesh, India	Uganda, South Africa, Tanzania	Brazil, Chile, Mexico, China, Viet Nam, South Korea

4. Exploring gendered politics of securing inclusive development

We start with the question of women's representation in political processes and institutions in section 4.1 and then move on to explore women's participation in policy making processes in section 4.2. Mobilization by women's movement and other organized actors on behalf of women for representation in formal politics and policy process and influencing policy outcomes are discussed in both sections 4.1 and 4.2. We also explore in both sections the policy outcomes that resulted from women's inclusion and participation in these spaces and processes. This sequencing allows us to focus on how gender politics of inclusion is linked with gendered nature of politics of influence.

4.1 Gendered politics: women's participation and representation in political institutions and processes

4.1.1 Women's representation in South Asia and Sub-Saharan Africa

Women's participation and representation in formal politics and decision making processes are formally endorsed by the South Asian and Sub Saharan African countries. Many of these countries have taken various measures to include women and ensure their access to the formal political arena. Compared to Sub Saharan Africa, South Asia performs badly as a region when it comes to women's representation in national parliament,[29] local government, executive positions[30], and the state administration (UNIFEM, 2008). However, women's representation in these formal bodies is increasing in both of these regions over the years.

The increase in women's presence as elected officials in national legislature and local government in Sub Saharan Africa and South Asia is a result of the following: various affirmative action measures such as quotas[31], party lists, that make women's inclusion mandatory; support for women's representation among senior party leadership; strong women's wing and internal party advocates to lobby for women's political representation; and gender equity promoting party ideology. An increase in women's representation in elected bodies does not automatically enable women representatives to be politically effective (i.e., increased program influence and policy leverage for gender equity). The support for and various other measures taken to increase women's presence in these elected bodies are themselves largely a result of negotiations between different social and political actors (political parties, their leadership, women within the parties, other influential party factions, women's movement etc). What influences the action taken by these actors are: the actual and perceived interests these actors have in promoting women's representation; the context within which opportunities for promoting women's representation arises; the strength (i.e. resources) of these actors to negotiate and influence other actors; and the gender discourses that influence actions of these actors.

The following table shows the measures taken to include women in elected bodies in the selected countries and the impact of these formal measures.

Table 4.1: Women in formal elected bodies in selected ESID case study countries in SA and SSA

Countries	Affirmative action measures	Implementation of these measures and effectiveness	Role of Women's Movement in demanding women's inclusion in elected bodies
Nepal	-Constitution stipulates that at least 5 percent of the total candidates contesting in the lower house election must be women -3 out of 60 seats are	-Measures implemented. -Made women visible in representative bodies. Women's representation in the parliament is about 33.2%.	-Women in Maoist insurgency and women's movement spearheaded demands for women's representation. Their participation in these movements created a

---

[29] The average value in Sub Saharan Africa is 16 per cent and the highest is 40 per cent in some countries; in South Asia the average value is 15 per cent and the highest is 34 per cent in some countries (UNIFEM, 2008),

[30] The average value of women in ministerial position in Sun Saharan Africa is 19 percent and the highest value is 45 per cent; the average value of women in ministerial positions in South Asia is 18 per cent and the highest value is 20 per cent (UNIFEM, 2008).

	reserved for women in the Upper House -About 20 per cent of all village and local councils are reserved for women.	-Inclusion into legislature did not translate into significant legislative changes for women.	sense of entitlement. -Women were a part of the Constitution drafting assembly.
India	-One third of the seats at the local level (panchayat-village council) are reserved for women (and caste) on a rotating basis, as well as one third of the council head (pradhan) positions through a Constitutional amendment. The *panchayat* councils were randomly selected to have female headships	-Measures implemented. -In the lower house, about 10.8 % are women and in the upper house women make up 10.3% of the house. -Made women visible in local bodies. Difficulties with proxy representation and violence against lower caste women representatives. -Increase in some areas local government being responsive to women's needs related to service delivery (i.e., water) and employment in government schemes	-Women's movement demanded reservations for women in local government. -Women's movement groups are demanding for change in the upper and lower houses of the parliament and this year reservation for women in parliament is being debated in both houses. Despite women being able to make demands on legal reforms, education etc in the post independence era for their role in the struggle for freedom, their claims for political participation proved difficult to push for. Though there was support for women's right to vote and be included in government because of their role in the independence struggle.
Bangladesh	-Constitution stipulates that 45 seats out of 345 in the parliament will be reserved for women -About 25 percent (3 out 13) seats are reserved for women in local government in the lowest tier (Union Parishad); at the Upzilla level (the next tier), one vice chair post in each Upzilla will be reserved for women	Measures implemented. -Over 12, 000 women elected to the Union Parishad. -64 women out of 345 (18.6%) are women in the national parliament. -Made women visible in the parliament and local government. Proxy representation is a key issue in local government and women MPs have a	-Women's movement demanded women's reservation and direct election to these seats. Initially women's quota was not a part of the movements demands, but women's participation in politics came up as a major issue during the authoritarian era. Democratization process created space for pushing this

		weaker voice. -At the local level, women have gained social legitimacy when it comes to social issues (marriage, violence against women etc) through their presence in Union Parishad arbitration council. Women MPs have been less successful in bringing about positive change	issue. -Coalition formed to promote this issue.
Rwanda	-Constitution stipulates that women should be granted at least 30% of posts in decision-making bodies and the Senate -24 seats out of 80 (30 per cent) in national assembly reserved for women -About 20 per cent seats are reserved for women in district council -Legal sanctions for noncompliance	-Measures implemented. -About 56% per cent MPs are women in the lower house and women make 34.6% of the Senate. -Women managed to pass the Inheritance Law (which allowed women to own property; open bank accounts etc in their own name) during the transitional government.	-Women's movement demanded women's effective representation in the post conflict state building period. Women's participation in the war created a sense of entitlement. -Women were a part of the Constitutional Assembly that drafted a new Constitution.
Uganda	-Constitution stipulates that the parliament shall consist of one woman representative in every district. -In addition of these 214 constituency representatives there are 71 women representatives for each district and quotas as per of other groups (youth, disabled etc) -One third of local government seats are reserved for women.	-Made women visible in decision-making bodies. -About 34.9% per cent members of the Parliament are women. -Women MPs failed to include the co-ownership clause in the Land Act and Domestic Relations act. -Women do not have a clear gender mandate in the local government and their legitimacy is questioned.	-Women's movement demanded effective representation to Museveni. Latter's focus on creating a modern Uganda and also constituencies for NRM votes created scope. -Women's organizations were a part of the consultation process for framing a new constitution.
South Africa	-The Municipal Structures Act stipulates that parties should ensure that	-Measures implemented. -In the lower house (National Assembly)	-The women's movement, particularly the Women's National

	50% of the candidates are women at the local level but no legal sanctions -ANC has 30% quota for women and 50% quota for women on party list at national level	women's representation is about 44.5% and 29.6 % in the Upper House. -The women MPs have managed to raise gender equity as a key issue in different policy making areas. They were also able to tackle (along with support from women's organizations) traditional authorities when it came to customary law and women's access to resources, marriage etc.	Committee made up of all party members and women's organizations were very vocal on the issue of women's representation. In the post apartheid era Women's National Committee whose members played a critical role in keeping the anti apartheid movement going could make strong demands. -Women's national committee members who were in political parties also active in Constitution writing and creating a Women's Charter reflecting women's demands.

Source: Adapted from UNIFEM (2008); statistics collected from Inter-parliamentary Union database (2011)

4.1.2. Factors related to the nature of political competition and political organization which effect women's presence in politics

Various structural factors influence whether a critical mass of women representatives will be present in elected bodies and political parties. The type of electoral system influences the willingness of the political parties to nominate female candidates for elections and the probabilities that women candidates may win elections. First-past the post system and single member constituencies that we see in India, Nepal, and Bangladesh create difficulties for women to be nominated for general seats since most political parties fear that they may lose these seats (Tamang, 2004; Rai, 1997; Chowdhury, 1994). This unwillingness of political parties results from women's lack of political *experience* (because of lack of political mentors and apprenticeship), and the male party member's reluctance to lose their constituencies to women members. Research shows that proportional representation and party lists[32] lead to a larger number of women being elected as demonstrated in the cases of, Peru, Argentina, Costa Rica, Bolivia, and South Africa (Araujo, 2010; Tadros, 2010; UNIFEM, 2008; Goetz and Hassim, 2003, Htun, 2004).

---

[32] In proportional representative system several candidates are elected in a district. Voters choose between parties rather than individuals in most cases and political parties receive a share of the seats based on the overall share of the vote. Most systems have closed lists where party determines the rank of the candidates, in open lists the voters may influence the order.

In contexts where the parties may be unwilling to nominate women, affirmative actions such as quotas, party lists for women, placement mandates, and legal sanctions for not implementing these actions ensure that a critical mass of women is elected to the parliament and local government bodies. The table above shows that all of the case study countries implemented quotas and these measures have increased visibility of women representatives in elected bodies. In Nepal, Rwanda, Peru, Argentina, Costa Rica, Bolivia, Paraguay legal sanctions for not implementing women's quotas in party lists and the pressure on political parties to implement these led to a large number of women being nominated by political parties. These measures also signaled the commitment of the state towards ensuring women's representation (Araujo, 2010; UNIFEM, 2008). Absence of legal sanctions on parties for not fielding women candidates and lack of effective support for women candidates may translate into female candidates hitting a 'ceiling of competition' i.e., increase in women candidates nominated as candidates do not lead to increase in numbers being elected as demonstrated in the case of Brazil (Araujo, 2010).[33]

   Quotas[34] have been one of the preferred pathways for ensuring women's representation in formal politics but they have been critiqued by feminist scholars as a 'quick fix' for addressing the andocentric nature of politics (Tadros, 2010; 2011; Phillips, 1991) and by others as 'undemocratic' (Goetz and Nyamu Musembi, 2008). Whether quotas are able to create legitimacy of women's representatives and whether they are able to 'act for' (Phillips, 1991; 1995) women is partly influenced by how quotas are introduced and whether a clear gender equity mandate exists for these women to act upon. At times, quotas are introduced in ways that expand the number of existing seats and women are included as 'add-ons' so that women's seats do not disturb existing competition for electoral wards or constituencies (for example, Uganda's local government; Bangladesh's local government and parliament). This in effect leads to women representing larger constituencies that are also meant to be represented by 'regular' ward representatives or MPs, and women are often sidelined. In Bangladesh, where women MPs are nominated by the parties to represent these add-on seats have their legitimacy as 'real' representatives questioned by the people. This add-on approach to gender quotas indicates the following: a) reluctance on the part of the political elite to disturb the existing organization of political power; b) opportunity to use the add-on seats as patronage for loyal supporters; c) increasing credentials as a gender-sensitive regime, through making superficial changes. At times, quotas may reach a plateau, especially if these are open party lists on potential candidates instead of actual candidates, after increasing the number of women representatives in the initial stages; and with numbers stabilizing requires reform (Araujo, 2010). In fact, the Brazillian experience shows that quota laws need to be drafted carefully. There also needs to be clear guidelines for implementing these. For example, in Mexico, the quota laws do not technically apply in districts where candidates are selected through primary election (Htun, 2005). A strong presence of women's movement monitoring compliance with the laws and rules of affirmative action and gender quotas proved effective in ensuring the implementation of the gender quota the case of Costa Rica (Sagot, 2010). Costa Rica did not have a placement mandate which allowed the parties to place women at the bottom of the list. In response to petition by national women's agency, the Supreme

---

[33] There was an initial increase in the number of women in office after party lists were introduced by it reached a plateau (Araujo, 2010).
[34] Quotas include: candidate quotas where women are required to be nominated to run for office; and reserved seats implies women hold a certain number of seats in the parliament or local government. In reserved seats women can be directly elected or nominated by others.

Court issued a ruling that compelled parties to place women in positions where they have a chance to be elected (Htun, 2005).

Direct link to a constituency can be effective in increasing women's legitimacy as representatives. In Bangladesh, at the Union Parishad level (lowest tier of local government), research shows that after the direct elections were introduced in 1997 in the reserved seats for women, women member's expectations and how the general public viewed their role underwent a qualitative shift, though women face various attitudinal and structural constraints (Nazneen and Tasneem, 2010). However, being directly elected by a constituency does not automatically lead to women representatives acting to promote women's interests. In Uganda, where women have a significant presence in District Assemblies, the fact that they do not have a clear gender mandate limits their effectiveness. The youth, army and all other groups that have reserved seats are elected by their national organizations which create legitimacy and provide a direct mandate to represent the group's interests. They are described as 'representatives of' these special interests. The gender quotas in Uganda were introduced to ensure numerical representation of women; women representatives running in reserved seats are not described as 'representatives of women's interests' but representatives for each district. Women running in these seats have to appeal to a narrow male district elite and professing a commitment to gender equity may not appeal to the electoral college which elects them (Goetz and Hassim, 2003, Tripp, 2003). In South Africa, where women representatives came in on a strong gender equity mandate created space for them to raise issues, although the system of party lists created difficulties where at times women had to tow the party line instead of promoting gender equity (Tripp, 2001, Hassim, 2003; Fester, in press).

Aside from these affirmative action measures, other factors also influence whether women are able to participate in electoral and party politics. Political party's views on gender equity and women's participation, recruiting and mentoring strategies, internal democracy and mobility within the parties and strength of the women's wing, all effect whether party policy debates are accessible to women's inputs and participation. The Latin American experience reveals that though women are present in large numbers among party rank and file there are relatively fewer women in leadership positions within these political parties which limits their ability to negotiate demands in party policy debates in leadership spaces (UNIFEM, 2008; Htun, 2005).[35] Strong women's wing, such as African National Congress' women's league played a central role in pushing for quotas on party lists and also party's position on gender equity during the transitional period in South Africa. The strong link ANC women's league had with other parties' women's wings and the women's organizations allowed them to create pressure within ANC and the parliament to promote gender equity issues (Kemp et al., 1995; Basu, 1995; Hassim, 2003, Fester, in press). Weak women's wings such as, those of Bangladesh's political parties, have limited possibilities of negotiating on women's representation and gender equity issues (Nazneen and Sultan, 2010). If gender equity is formally endorsed by the senior party leadership and the party ideology, as in the case of ANC in South Africa, then pushing for women's representation in formal politics and promotion of gender equity policies become relatively easier. In Rwanda, endorsement

---

[35] A 2008 study reveals that there is systematic discrepancy between member numbers and leadership positions in Latin America. In Paraguay, 46.5 per cent party members are women but only 18.9 per cent are executives in party leadership. Mexico has an average of 50 per cent women in both major parties but they hold only 30 percent of the executive posts (UNIFEM, 2008).

by Kagame and the ruling party has made promotion of women's representation and gender equity policies relatively easier (Burnet, 2008).

Whether formal endorsement of gender equity by party's senior leadership translates into increasing women's influence as a group depends on the level of institutionalization and the level of command and control (centralized or localized) of the party. If the party organization has a 'informal-centralized' model then, promotion of gender equity interests (including women's representation) will largely rely on patronage systems and dominant individual leaders than on transparent rules based systems (Goetz and Hassim, 2003; Tripp, 2003). All our case study countries in South Asia and Sub Saharan Africa have political parties that fit this model. These type of parties can promote women's interests quickly and allow for inclusion of a large number of women in politics, since the centralized party leadership is able to overcome resistance from a conservative opposition. The influence of women representatives in these parties will depend on their relationship with the top leadership and their patronage. Both Rwanda's- Rwandan Patriotic Front (RPF) and Uganda's National Resistance Movement (NRM) had leadership who were willing to promote women's representation and gender equitable policies, which led to measures being taken to increase women's representation at various levels and various policy measures for promoting gender equity. In Uganda, NRM leadership was interested in women's representation mainly for the following reasons: a) establishing a vote bank through creation of a new constituency; b) appearing to address a 'progressive' agenda that enhances NRM's legitimacy (Goetz, 2003a, Tripp, 2003). The disadvantage of an informal-centralized model is that once patronage is withdrawn, women's influence inside the party and in policymaking can erode quickly, as can be seen in the Ugandan case in the last decade (Tripp, 2003; Goetz, 2003b).

Besides party type, the nature and culture of political competition influence women's participation in politics. Campaign financing systems, levels of violence and intimidation in political campaigns influence women's participation in politics (Tripp, 2003). Women have a weaker resource base. In Brazil, where funds are collected by the parties and distributed according to priorities, women face significant difficulties (Araujo, 2010). Where significant finances are required to run for office and campaign financing is inadequately monitored by the state, women tend to lose out. Rising levels of violence and criminal elements in campaign, as in the case of Bangladesh, masculinize political spaces which exclude women. In Uganda, women MPs experienced sexual harassment in Parliament (Tamale, 1999) and in Zambia women politicians reported having marital problems and conflict because of their participation in politics (Tripp, 2001). The culture of aggressive political debates in parliaments and in local government bodies (and other political spaces) may also reduce political effectiveness of women who are newcomers in politics, particularly those who are the first generation to come in through quotas. The lack of knowledge on government or parliamentary procedures and expertise on technical matters also contribute to women's silence. Research on South African local women councilors, Bangladeshi women MPs show that otherwise active and vocal women being silent in formal meetings (Fester, in press; Mbatha, 2003; Tripp, 2001; Chowdhury, 1994).

4.3 Do women representatives 'act for' women?

So far, we have focused on pathways of getting women into politics and what enhances or hinders women's representation in formal politics. Is there a positive relationship between women's representation in formal politics and voice in public

debates leading to gender equitable outcomes? Undoubtedly, quotas, party lists and other forms of affirmative actions have increased women's descriptive representation. This form of representation has value since it changes social perception about women being in political spaces and creates possibilities for articulation of women's needs and gender equity concerns (Mansbridge, 1999). Beaman et al.'s (2008) study on *panchayats* in India reveals that men as they are exposed to female leadership, their prejudice against women's performance reduces overtime, though their preference for male representatives may not change.

The empirical evidence on whether descriptive representation leads to substantial representation remains inconclusive (Childs and Krook, 2009[36]). Many studies show that presence of women can lead to changes in legislation, debates, policies, while there are others that show little or no difference in styles and behaviors of male and female leaders. It is argued that since women are in the minority in most legislatures and policy making spaces, if a critical mass of women were present, they would have a significant impact. Studies show that a critical mass[37] of women in local level forest management committees (Agarwal, 2011) or in parliament such as in Nordic countries have led to women being able to influence positive program and policy outcomes (UNIFEM, 2008). Studies conducted in the Western democracies reveal that presence of a critical mass of women allow them to raise matters of concern, especially issues such as reproductive health, violence against women, policing , labor rights (see Cueva, 2004; Weldon, 2002). Interestingly, both Weldon's study (2002) which uses inter parliamentary data sets and Htun's (in press) recent research on parliaments using large data sets indicate that a critical mass of women in parliament is more effective when there are strong links with women's movements and an effective national gender machinery exists (see sections 4.1.4 and 4.1.5). These findings of these two studies indicate that there is a need to move beyond critical mass theory and focus on *how* the substantive representation of women occurs instead of just focusing on 'when' women act for women.

One of the weaknesses of critical mass theory is that it assumes that there is a linear relationship between numbers and outcomes and a (yet unknown) tipping point at which there is substantive representation (Childs and Krook, 2009). This linear assumption does not always hold. How women (or male) representatives may choose to act depends on: a) contexts and opportunities for raising women's needs and gender equity concerns; b) identity and interests of the individual representatives; c) how representatives and others perceive 'women's issues'[38] ; d) gendered nature of policy making processes. John's (2007) study on women representatives in urban municipalities in India indicates that the presence of a critical mass of women may not *automatically* lead to promotion of gender equity concerns. The female councillors in reserved seats pointed out that they did not act as a group to address 'women's issues' and gender equity concerns. However, some of them stated that during the time of crisis they came together. For example, women councillors in Bangalore were active when it came to women's welfare issues, such as widow's pension. In Delhi, the women councillors passed a resolution regarding a particular case a woman was killed by a security guard. In most cases, female councillors said they acted as individuals who were linked to their parties and did not want to be identified as representatives of

---

[36] See Childs and Krook (2009) for a detailed discussion on critical mass theory and also details of how this issue has been researched.
[37] The popular notion is that one third of the representatives are women.
[38] See below for discussion on women's issues.

women's interests or gender equity which put them at a disadvantage (see below on Agarwal's point on women *sarpanchs*, 2011).

In fact, feminist scholars point out that affirmative action measures do not *automatically* reproduce substantial representation (Phillips, 1991; 1995; Htun, 2004; Tadros, 2011), as the impact of women's inclusion is mediated by different factors. Women who were elected by these measures may not necessarily perceive themselves as representatives of women's interests or gender equity concerns. Women ushered in through the gender quota by different affirmative action measures may not necessarily focus on negotiating gender equitable program and policy outcomes for women or have policy leverage. Feminist scholars have critiqued that the underlying principle of quotas is essentialist since quotas take gender as proxy for representing gender equity concerns. In other words it homogenizes women assuming that all women have the same values and that men are unable to represent gender equity concerns (Goetz and Nyamu-Musembi, 2008). How do these concerns play out in case of the ESID countries?

In fact, other studies conducted in India shows that quotas work well for social groups that are geographically concentrated with clear group interests, particularly for groups based on caste than gender (Htun, 2004). As gender interests are shaped by multiple factors and women in an electoral constituency have diverse interests as a social group, representation of these through gender quotas taking 'women as an independent category' is difficult (Menon, 2000). Research also shows that quotas in many contexts, such as in Rwanda, Uganda, Bangladesh, Egypt have largely benefited educated and politically elite women in accessing political office, however, their social legitimacy to represent gender equity concerns or understanding of women's group interests may be constrained (Tadros, 2010; Burnet, 2008; Tamale, 1999; Chowdhury, 1994).

Though the connection between women's presence in politics and inclusion of issues in public debate that are *perceived* as 'women's issues' such as domestic violence, food crop, reproductive health, is inconclusive; women representatives do tend to express more concern over domestic violence, reproductive health and women's welfare compared to men (Tripp, 2003; Goetz and Nyamu-Musembi, 2008; UNIFEM, 2008). Rai's (1997) study on women parliamentarians in India show that although women's issues were not high priority issues for women MPs, most felt the compulsion to take up issues of women's welfare and violence against women, and tended to unite women MPs across party line. In all of the case study countries, particularly in Rwanda and South Africa, during the transitional period women representatives have focused their energies on reforming or introducing new laws on domestic violence, reproductive health and property rights (Goetz and Hassim, 2003; Tripp, 2003; Burnet, 2008). In Uganda, Rwanda, South Africa women representatives were a part of Constitutional Commissions and were able to include gender equality clauses in the constitution despite opposition by traditional elites (Goetz and Hassim 2003; Tripp 2003; Burnet, 2008).

Women parliamentarians in Rwanda, Uganda and South Africa have created cross party caucuses on gender equality, and in South Africa they have created a standing committee in the Parliament on women's rights. These caucuses have had mixed successes in promoting gender equality in parliamentary debates. The Rwandan women's caucus was instrumental in drafting and lobbying for the Inheritance Act in 1999, which allowed women to register property and open bank accounts under their own name for the first time (Burnet, 2008). In Uganda, women caucus was able to use the principle of non discrimination to push through affirmative action for women's representation and incorporate equity clauses in the constitution. However, they were

not effective in promoting the co-ownership clause in the Land Act, as they could not create a common platform given the NRM party leadership was not in agreement with this demand (Goetz, 2003a, Tripp, 2003). In South Africa, it was the ANC women's caucus rather than the cross party women's caucus which created effective links with the male parliamentarians and lobbied for change in the Constitution and other gender equitable policies (Kemp et al, 1995; Hassim, 2003). In Brazil, *bancada femina*, the women's caucus in Brazilian Congress along with feminist lobbying groups have managed to secure approval of numerous laws, including laws against domestic violence and sexual harassment, legislation on women's health and maternity benefits (Sardenberg and Acosta, forthcoming; UNIFEM, 2008)   Interestingly, all of these countries also had strong women's groups and coalitions which were lobbying the state and the women representatives on these issues. The state and top political party leaders were initially willing to support these agenda.[39]   These findings indicate that a closer analysis of the contextual factors within which gender quotas are being introduced is required for understanding political effectiveness of women representatives.

Unsurprisingly, given the entrenched nature of patriarchy combined with other class, caste, racial interests at the local level, women representatives have difficulties in promoting gender equitable programs and policies in the case study countries. Studies in India, Bangladesh, Uganda show that women representatives face male resistance in accessing development budgets, centrally allocated resources and in chairing important committees (Hossain and Akhter, 2011; Mohanty, 2007; Goetz, 2003a). Countries such as Bangladesh, have provisions that stipulate that women should be chairs of at least one third of all project development committees and members of one third project implementation committees and distribute 30 per cent of the resources allocated by the center. Though these provisions ensured women's inclusion into committees, their capacity to represent gender equity concerns remains debatable and the women members have been used by chairs to implement their own projects (Nazneen and Tasneem, 2010).

Despite these difficulties faced by women representatives in the local government, both quantitative and qualitative studies show that women representatives have tried to address complaints filed by women and practical gender needs of women such as water and other common resource management, women's employment in government employment or project schemes etc. Comparative research on *panchayats* in West Bengal and Rajasthan in India show that there is a systematic difference in the complaints and requests filed based on the sex of the person filing the complaint. More women than men filed complaints on water resource management. The number of drinking water projects were 60 per cent higher in councils with female *sarpanch* (heads) compared to the councils which had male *sarpanchs*. In West Bengal, female led councils undertook road building projects at a higher rate than male led councils, where jobs were likely to go to females. The authors of the study claim that there was no difference in the type of requests that were made to male and female headed councils but the difference was in the nature of response to women's requests (Chattopadhay and Duflo, 2004). Admittedly, just because female *sarpanchs* prioritized water or roads do not necessarily imply that these are perceived as women's needs, even if more women have complained about these. In fact Agarwal (2011) points out that many of the female *sarpanchs* perceive these as general issues that are important for both men and women in their constituency. She also argues that perception about what is considered

---

[39] Though in the case of Uganda, the co-ownership clause was omitted from the Land Act passed in 1998; and the Domestic Relations Bill was not passed (Tripp, 2004).

as women's needs at times may adversely influence what is taken up in the local councils. In fact, female representatives may be reluctant to push issues that are perceived as 'women's issues' or being identified as the women's representative since these may put them at a disadvantage electorally (Goetz and Nyamu-Musembi, 2008).

In Bangladesh, women representatives at the Union Parishad have gained social legitimacy through taking an active part in Union Parishad arbitration council and also in informal *shalish* (alternative dispute resolution mechanism). They are able to do so because there is: a) demand from women; b) acceptance among local community of women's role; c) little male resistance inside the Union Parishad as women member's being active in resolving disputes around 'women's issues' such as divorce, custody etc which did not place the women representatives in direct competition with the male members over resources (Nazneen and Tasneem, 2010).

Although these positive case studies on how an increase in women's numbers in the parliament and the local government bodies may women's increase policy leverage and gender equitable outcomes, there are considerable research gaps. This is not to say that quotas and other affirmative actions do not help. These, as pointed out before, have a strong demonstration effect (Mansbridge, 1999, Beaman et al., 2008). However, systematic and comparative research on women representatives may help to explore: what type of women enter politics through quotas; what type of gender agenda is espoused by them; how do women become critical actors promoting gender equity; what strategies do women use to negotiate gender equity interests given other group interests with their parties and other social actors; when and why do other actors facilitate the promotion of gender equity agenda etc.

4.1.4 Women's representation and participation in bureaucracy, invited spaces and in informal institutions and their impact

Women's representation and participation in elected bodies is one of the ways for enhancing women's political effectiveness. Increased women's presence within bureaucracy, including women in spaces created by the state and policy processes are others ways of representing women's interests. Rai (1996) argues that women representatives in elected bodies are not enough to ensure promotion of gender equitable policies and implementation of these policies. The difficulties women representatives face in the political sphere led women's movement activists and also the state to focus on ensuring representation of women in other institutional forums. These forums include various government machineries, women's ministries, gender commissions etc. We also focus on the invited spaces (semi formal) created by the state for engaging citizens at the community/local levels such as health watch committees; and policy consultation processes, such as those for the Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSP)etc. Section 4.2 discusses the role of these national gender machineries and women inside state bureaucracy in detail and their effect on policy processes; hence the discussion in this section will be largely on women's representation and participation in these spaces. We also discuss women's representation and participation in traditional institutions, which play a key role in influencing gender norms and access to resources and influence the possibilities for gender equity at the local level.

National gender machineries

The case study countries have created national gender machineries for 'bureaucratized representation' (Goetz, 2003b) to promote women's interests and

gender equity in state programs and policy. In Chile, Servicio Nacional de la Mujer (SERNAM), the national women's machinery, played a key role in policymaking, advocating successfully to for legislation on domestic violence, sexual harassment, and gender discrimination, including laws on day care for seasonal workers and maternity leave for domestic employees. Its success is partly due to sector targeted strategy, institutional clout, the rank its director has as a minister which allows her to participate in cabinet meetings. In Rwanda, the Women and Gender Ministry played a key role in creating a clear gender focus within the bureaucracy and in packaging and disseminating women's demands that emerge through the Women's Councils at the village level and their national secretariat (Burnet, 2008). In Uganda, Women's Ministry which had strong links with women's organizations and association acted to promote their demands (Goetz, 2003a). For Bangladesh, Uganda, Rwanda, Nepal, the discussion in international UN women's conferences on state gender machineries facilitated the establishment of national gender machineries. In the Sub Saharan context, for Rwanda, South Africa, these national gender machineries, such as Gender Equality Commission (South Africa), Ministry of Women and Gender (Rwanda) were also products of negotiations between women's movement and the transitional government, where the latter wanted to signal its commitment to gender equity. In Chile the democratic transition and women's participation in the democratic movement, and pressure by women's movement on the state and political parties created space for creation of SERNAM (Waylen, 1997; Frohman and Valdez, 1995).

The effectiveness of these national machineries depends on their: expertise, budgets, ability to review policies formulated by other departments, co-ordinate different policies on gender, sanction other departments if they fail to promote gender equity in their policies. In Bangladesh, though there the Ministry of Women and Children's Affairs (MOWCA) co-ordinates the affairs of other ministries using gender focal points, it has limited influence since it lacks teeth and cannot sanction any ministry or government bodies for not addressing gender equity in their policies or programs (UNIFEM, 2008). Resource constraint is a major drawback, in South Africa the Gender Equality Commission's work was stretched in terms of time, staff, and money, which created difficulties for it to fulfill its mandate (Fester, forthcoming). In Chile, SERNAM's activities have been constrained by lack of finance, lack of autonomy, close ties with political parties and absence of institutional power to influence other ministries. At times SERNAM's goals that threaten gender relations have been overtly opposed by other ministries and government bodies (Waylen, 1997).

Besides institutional factors stated above, political and international context may favorably affect these national machineries ability to perform. The work of the Commission on the Status of Women in India (CSWI) attracted attention during the UN women's decade which led to a concerted effort to study the impact of various development measures on poor and rural women in India. CSWI's work was also gained importance because the emergency period imposed by the Congress in the 1970s, which created a context where work on women was not considered politically dangerous as other subjects (Kumar, 1995; Basu, 1995). Many of the national gender machineries had gained momentum and support from the state around the time of Beijing conference (UNIFEM, 2008), which points to the role played by international discourse for creating space (see in section 4.2 the role played by ICPD and Beijing).

Women in bureaucracy

Randall and Waylen (1998) point out that bureaucracy is a gendered hierarchy where women occupy the lower ranks; and inclusion of women in higher positions creates the possibility for changing this gendered hierarchy. Uganda and Rwanda have taken affirmative action for including women in the cabinet and also in high level bureaucratic positions. Whether inclusion of women in bureaucracy through quotas and in higher positions changes how it addresses gender needs depends on which women are incorporated through affirmative action and whether they have interests in promoting gender equity. Goetz (2003b) point out that women in the cabinet or chief executives are less likely to be feminists promoting women's strategic interests. Even if they had strong links with the women's movement, as Goetz's study (2003a) on Uganda shows, feminist women in Museveni's cabinet were unable to speak for incorporation of the co-ownership clause since they had to adhere to collective responsibility of the cabinet. Besides high level women executive, top bureaucratic officials may act as 'femocrats' to advance gender equitable policies (Kardam, 1997). Bringing a policy into being requires skillful mobilization of facts, accurate identification and cultivation of allies within the bureaucracy, and ensuring fit between the suggested policy changes and the goals of the specific bureaucratic organization. Section 4.2 discusses the role played by 'femocrats' in policy processes to bring about gender equitable policies in more detail.

Women's representation in public bureaucracies can be increased through quotas. For example, Bangladesh has a 15 per cent quota for women in bureaucracy. These quotas can help women to overcome barriers to entry but they may also stall further recruitment (as in the case of Bangladesh) and undermine the perceived merit of women who were hired to fill quotas. In Bangladesh, women bureaucrats are also concentrated in higher numbers in 'softer' sectors such as education and health, which then reduces possibilities of women's representation in important sectors such as finance, infrastructure, agriculture etc (Sultan, n.d.). Studies conducted in the US show that bureaucratic officials, irrespective of gender are willing to promote gender equity concerns when: a) there is room for maneuver within the organization to raise gender concerns; b) when addressing gender concerns would not lead to sanctions and would advance their careers (UNIFEM, 2008). These indicate the importance of the design of the institutional systems that incentivizes promoting gender equity concerns.

Presence of women in larger numbers in specific sectors may create a scope for increased responsiveness to women's practical gender needs at the front line level. Studies are inconclusive about whether gender of the staff influences how frontline workers address women's needs. However, Goetz's (1997b) study on state and NGO microfinance programs show that women workers had a more intuitive understanding of the difficulties faced by their clients and were more willing to address gender concerns such as violence by the husband or women's control over credit. Women clients were also more comfortable in raising issues with the female frontline workers given the gendered hierarchical nature of the relationship between the worker and the client. In fact, women workers were more willing to act as 'principled agents' (Dilulio, 1994) and use their discretionary powers to address these concerns raised by their clients. Although these understandings did not translate into systematic action on behalf of the frontline workers since the incentive, monitoring, and performance measurement systems did not include addressing gender equity concerns as performance measurement/ monitoring indicator.

Women's participation and inclusion in invited spaces and citizen's forums

Contemporary measures for enhancing responsiveness of the state include creation of new spaces for consultation on service delivery and policy processes. These spaces are created by the state, through legislation or as a result of demands raised by the civil society. They are semi-autonomous spaces outside formal institutions of politics (Cornwall and Coleho, 2007). Women's inclusion and participation in these spaces create possibilities for negotiations around women's needs and gender equity concerns. Case studies analyzed by Cornwall and Colheo (2007)[40] show that the extent to which women's needs and gender equity concerns are represented in these spaces depends on the following: a) who (including which women) enters these spaces and their ability to voice demands; b) how representation of women's needs and gender equity is facilitated in these spaces; c) do these spaces have authority to influence the way service is delivered, d) whether women and other actors willing act on behalf of women are able to establish horizontal and vertical links with other groups and state actors. Mohanty's (2007) research on watershed project committee's in Rajasthan, India, illustrates these points. She found that women were included in these committees but had a marginal role, since it was the men who decided which women were included. The functioning of these committees was gendered with decision making power concentrated with men (heads of the household and upper caste). Interestingly in the same area the women's participation in Integrated Child Development Scheme (ICSD) was high and effective. Women in these participating in these schemes were recruited from the community by government officials, which rendered a form of 'professional' status on women. The thrust is on forming women's self help groups. Given that the area the project focuses on is identified as 'women's issues' (nutrition, pre-school education, immunization) the women have more agency and voice. This demonstrates that the institutional design of these forums and local gender ideologies have strong influences on whether women are able to participate effectively.

The lack of an institutionalized place in policy/service delivery discussions and formal rights to redress may constrain the quality of women's participation and representation in these invited spaces. Goetz (2003b) analysis of joint monitoring of the Public Distribution Scheme (PDS) in Mumbai, India illustrates these points. The Regional Controller of Rationing had invited civil society groups, including women's groups, to participate in official monitoring and clean-up effort. Women's groups have been informally monitoring leakage of subsidized commodities onto the black market. However, no formal rights were extended to women's groups to be present in monitoring exercises, to access official information, or to lodge complaints about corruption. Consequently, after the sympathetic Regional Controller left women lost access to this official space.

Community gendered norms and power relations at the local level may limit how much space women have for voicing their demands and the role they play. Agarwal's (2002) comparative research on Joint Forest Management (JFM) groups in India and Nepal found that communities were resistant to women's representation in these spaces created by the state. In community forest groups where external actors, such as, gender sensitive state officials, NGOs, have stipulated conditions on women's inclusion in committees and focused on distributional equity issues, women's participation in the CFG's changed. Effective links with women's movement organizations or social

---

[40] Not all of the cases studies focus on women in this edited volume. See Mohanty (2007); Mahmud (2007).

movement oriented organizations with a strong focus on gender brings women's interests into the forefront in these spaces. Mahmud's (2007) study on the local Health Watch Committees created (HWC) by the Ministry of Health in Bangladesh found that most visible changes occurred at the community level, where mobilization and awareness building by a social movement NGO with a strong focus on women's rights had created an acceptance of the committee and created a new discourse around the right to health care for men and women.

So far most of the research discussed above has focused on: how various structural factors limit women's participation, specific program or case analysis of where women have successfully negotiated for change in delivery of services or engagement in state programs, and how women's sense of citizenship emerged from being engaged in 'invited' forums or state created spaces (Agarwal, 2011, Cornwall and Coleho, 2007). A political settlement perspective may allow us is to trace in a context specific, historical manner how these different methods used for women's inclusion into these state created forums, lead from development of sense of citizenship towards a redrawing of social contracts with the state by women as a collective group?

Decentralization and Its Impact on Women's Inclusion and Participation

A few implicit assumptions in policy literature are: decentralization helps in raising women's voice and increases access to the state and improves accountability and responsiveness of the state at the local level to women (Goetz, 2003b). There are fewer studies on how decentralization which leads to shifts in service delivery effect women's participation and representation of women's interests (Macpherson, 2008). Macpherson (2008) points out that local communities are not homogenous. Gender politics compounded with other identity based interests such as race, class, caste, ethnicity etc may be make it difficult women to promote gender equitable policies. Decentralization in terms of power and control over resources from the center usually takes place when there is an important pay off in terms of buying the loyalties of dissenting groups or palliating political ambitions of sub-national, regional, political rivals (in many cases the traditional elite). Women as a group rarely have the political strength to count as dissenting groups or political rivals at the sub-national/ regional/local levels whose loyalties need to be bought off. In these contexts, decentralization may reinforce patriarchal norms and practices within the new spaces created. For example, women's organizations in South Africa have accused the Department of Local Government in prioritizing traditional elite interests over gender equity concerns. Interests of traditional and ethnically/ defined local elites may constrain how local government departments acts in addressing gender equity concerns in service delivery. Traditional authorities have also objected to introduction of democratic councils and women's representation in councils that had strained relations between elected women councilors and the traditional elites in South Africa (Mbatha, 2003).

Creation of gender sensitive processes in how local government institutions and local citizen's councils or state-created- consultative forums operate is usually implemented in a ritualistic manner, which limits their effectiveness. Kerala and Madhya Pradesh provinces in India require one third of the participants in village meetings to be female to reach quorum. Kerala requires local councils to earmark ten per cent of the development funds they receive from the state for 'women's development projects' and all female sub groups of the village assembly are in charge of planning for and spending this fund. However, there are cases reported in Kerala where women have been coerced into diverting these funds for other purposes. Local councilors have tried to influence

which type of women are present in village assemblies to make the 30 per cent quorum (Goetz, 2003b).

Women in informal spaces

Similar to all other institutions, informal institutions are gender biased. Generally studies focus on traditional institutions that use customary laws to resolve marital/ property related disputes; and they show that women's access and representation are limited in these spaces and the outcomes in many cases do not promote gender equity (Goetz, 2003b). In South Africa, the traditional authorities have consistently upheld customary laws and practices that subordinate women's rights to land, to those of husbands/father/sons when adjudicating over land (Mbatha, 2003). Research on *shalish* (informal mechanisms for dispute resolution) systems in Bangladesh, show that even the NGO reformed *shalish* where women are included as adjudicators, largely tender gender inequitable verdicts. However, inclusion of women into the adjudicator's panel and also modifying the shalish process (i.e., serving formal notice to the defendant and the person filing the case; recording proceeding etc) create a scope for women to be present in the process and be heard. The formalization and follow up processes also make it likely that the verdict will be implemented. Interviews with both male and female adjudicators show that though they received gender training their verdicts are influenced by gendered notions of what women are entitled to and the realities of the nature of the gender power relations in the rural Bangladeshi context (Hasle, 2003).

4.1.5 Women's movements representing and negotiating women's need and gender equity

Table 4.1 shows that women's movement played a key role in advocating the agenda for increased women's representation in formal political spaces. Tables 4.1, 4.2, 4.3 and conclusion of section 4.2 illustrate the role played by women's movement in demanding women's inclusion in policy spaces and promoting gender equity agenda. The discussion above of different cases also show that strong links between women representatives and women's movement, issue based coalitions created by women's movement played a key role in highlighting women's needs/ gender equity concerns in policy making processes. Women's movement's role in policy process is discussed further in section 4.2. This section largely focuses on the strategies and tactics used by women's movement, including at the grassroots, in representing women's interests in political processes and the impact of the different strategies on ensuring gender equitable outcomes.

Women's movements in developing countries have a long history; women's groups and associations (including feminist groups) have been a part of anti-colonial movements, independence struggles, anti-authoritarian movements (Basu, 1995; Waylen, 1996; Molyneux, 2001). Women's participation in these independence or anti colonial struggles, revolutions or wider political movements have allowed women during critical moments of state formation make claims over being included in political institutions and policy (see later in this section and section 4.1.6 on ESID countries). Usually this history is overlooked in mainstream gender and development literature and by the opponents of women's rights who label women's movement in the developing countries as a western import (Basu, 1995). This label has been strategically used by the traditional elites and other oppositional groups to undermine women's/ feminist

demands. Women's movement has had to take this label into consideration while developing strategies for mobilization.

Women's and feminist groups are diverse in nature in terms of size; location (i.e., local, regional, national, international); type (activist organization; research and policy advocacy organization; mass movement based organizations etc)[41]. Despite being vibrant and innovative, the women's movement have had fewer success in terms of engendering political processes and institutions (even taking into consideration the introduction of quotas) in the last century than when it came to agendas around violence against women or social welfare issues (Basu, 2010).[42] Feminist scholars argue that the women's movement have been successful in pursuing legal reforms and bringing about changes in state policies in particular areas such as reproductive health, education for women, child welfare, labor rights etc. However, they also point out that these policy changes were facilitated by the instrumental needs of the state such as controlling population growth, increasing productivity etc. Some also argue that the feminists have been more successful in bringing discursive changes in how women are thought about as a development category compared to tangible policy gains (Mukhopadhay and Singh, 2007).

At the national level, particularly mobilization around policy processes have been led by women's groups which are largely composed of professional-middle class and elite women. Their leadership results from the following: a) these women are able to put in unpaid voluntary time for activism; b) they have the technical knowledge and capacity required for policy analysis; c) they also have access to the policymakers and different forums where these issues are discussed. The elite and middle-class based composition of women's /feminist groups and their leadership in mobilization around policies have led to debates on elite bias/ focus in women's/ feminist movement. It has also raised questions about whether women's groups effectively represent interests of its grassroots members and their accountability to this constituency (Basu, 2010). In fact, women's movement organizations at the national level in some of the case study countries, such as Bangladesh, have been successful in mobilizing around violence against women and legal reforms and failed to mobilize around issues that are pertinent to poor rural women, such as migration or needs of women in the informal sector etc. In Brazil, Chile and Mexico, feminism took the form of 'popular feminism' only when the movement was able to bring into the fold concerns of urban and rural working-class women's concerns (Lamas et al; 1995; Frohman and Valdez, 1995; Soares et al., 1995). The elite and middle class bias in women's movement and whether it is able to represent the interests of poor women or create strong alliances with grassroots and working women's groups is a debate that is pertinent for unpacking political settlement around gender from a feminist perspective.

At the local level, grassroots women's groups have usually mobilized around practical gender needs such as, the quality of service delivery by the state with the focus

---

[41] See Molyneux (2001)

[42] This does not imply that women's representation in politics was not highlighted in the feminist agenda/or activists. The second wave of feminism focused more on economic and social aspects of women's citizenship, particularly, 'private' matters such as domestic violence, women workers and family law that are deeply connected to patriarchy. Whereas, the first wave had focused on women's political rights, such as the right to vote etc. By the second wave of feminist movement started in most Western democracies, women had the right to vote and other formal political rights, though the gender bias within political institutions remained. Given this context, when agenda were drawn up for action, it was influenced by the context within which women's issues were being debated.

on holding the state to account (Macpherson, 2008 Kemp et al., 1995; Soares et al., 1995; Molyneux, 2001). These movements focusing on local concerns have allowed women to contextualize their concerns within the wider social/ political context and also integrate a gender analysis. While some of these movements are focused on specific or singular issues, such as women's protests against price-hikes in India or Kenya; or protest against dismantling of state services as in Peru or Chile etc (Basu, 1995; Waylen, 1997). This does not imply that these local movements did not larger structural inequities and gender inequity. For example, the anti-alcohol movement in Andhra Pradesh India by local women's groups, not only focused on banning alcohol and violence against women and created space for raising different issues, it also created of a sense of citizenship among women and demands for wider participation (Goetz and Nyamu Musembi, 2008). Grassroots membership organizations, such as SEWA in India, which aimed at organizing informal women workers, have been successful in creating structures and strategies that allow them to negotiate workers wages and working conditions at the local level and also in national policy spaces (Kabeer, 1994). Domestic women workers association in Brazil (Sardenberg and Acosta, in press), membership based migrant women workers association in Bangladesh, had started off as small associations to increase their member's negotiation skills (Nazneen and Sultan, forthcoming). These later evolved into larger organizations with a wider network focusing on pressuring national strategies and policies that would serve interests of their members. (see section 4.2 on role of local women actors or organized groups participating in policy processes and demanding reforms or state accountability).

Women's groups use diverse strategies for mobilizing and negotiating around gender equity related concerns at different political and social forums. Analysis of women's movement in the selected ESID case study countries show that, these movements both by grassroots, policy advocates, and other organizations use the following common strategies: a) build coalitions within the movement on particular issues; b) form alliances with other CSOs and the media; c) target selective parts of the state bureaucracy, including local government, concerned ministries, the national gender machinery; d) cultivate allies among women representatives and also male politicians; e) use international women's rights discourse/human rights discourse to package their demands; f) establish and highlight their expertise and experience on the particular gender equity issue around which they are mobilizing (Basu, 2010; Nazneen and Sultan, in press; Randall, 1998).

These strategies have produced mixed results on legitimizing women's demands and generating responsiveness from the state and political actors. The issue-based coalitions and alliances have raised visibility of women's activism within the civil society arena, and also helped to project the strength of their demands to the state and political actors. For example, the Ugandan Land Alliance was crucial in raising women's demands for co-ownership (Tripp, 2004). However, these coalitions suffer from internal power struggles. Usually the well resourced, national groups tend to dominate how agendas are set and the activities of the coalitions, and marginalize the grassroots organizations. This has implications for whether coalitions are seen as being representative of a wider constituency around a particular issue. The CEDAW ratification coalition in Bangladesh is a good example of this particular legitimacy problem (Nazneen and Sultan, forthcoming). Discussions in previous sections on Uganda and South Africa show that allies within the state bureaucracy and political parties, particularly men, and the strong links between women's movement and women representatives created scope for the movements to raise their issues in various forums (Goetz, 2003a; Mbatha, 2003; Hassim, 2003). These coalitions and alliances also

demonstrated a clear constituency for which the 'femocrats' and sympathetic representatives were working.

Expertise-based women's movement organizations and activists have, as legal or development professionals, been used to justify feminist analysis of particular problems and the solutions proposed. Feminist organizations and lawyers have used their experience of providing legal aid to women as the basis for demanding changes in family law in Egypt, Bangladesh, Morocco (Al-Sharmani, in press). Women's organizations have also used 'testimonies' of affected women, such as those of victims of violence or widows and abandoned women who suffered from not having joint titles or inheritance rights to demand changes in inheritance/land rights (Burnet, 2008; Kawamara-Mishambi and Ovonji-Odida, 2003). These experience-based strategies were also used to counter accusations that women's organizations because of their own class/caste/ethnic positions are unable to represent the demands of grassroots women or women from other groups. In Uganda, women's groups arranged for public hearing with testimonies from rural women to counter that the movement for co-ownership clause has a narrow social base (Kwamara- Mishambi and Ovonji-Odida, 2003).

Targeting selective parts of the state which are responsive to women's rights by women's movement have produced results in representing women's rights issues in different state forums. In the case study countries women's movement have targeted particular ministries or different levels of the government depending on the nature of the demand and the context within which issues are being raised. This indicates that there are plural entry points in dealing with the state and that opportunities for women may vary across different state institutions (Randall, 1998). Comparative studies of how these entry points vary and in-country analysis of when and how women's movement have been able to access different state institutions need to be conducted.

The space available to women's groups to promote a gender equity agenda in politics may vary depending political opportunity framework and context. States that are going through a transitional phase where the stability of elite alignments is in flux may create opportunities for women's movement to participate in the negotiation processes and promote gender equity concerns. Feminist studies show that immediately after independence or in the post revolutionary period there is a high level of interest in women's position and condition among the political elite. These issues are closely tied to modernizing/nation building agenda which lends them legitimacy (Waylen, 1996). Women's movement is able to establish effective links with the political leadership and state during this period, but this interest in improving women's status among state and political actors weans as time passes (Molyneux, 1985; Goetz, 2003b; Basu, 1995). They also point out that women's movement lose their voice and influence on the public agenda after the country transitions into a more stable post authoritarian/ post revolutionary context, as seen in the case of Chile, South Africa, Nicaragua (Molyneux, 1985; Waylen, 1996; Basu, 1995).

The observations above hold true for some of our case study countries. The state and the political leadership took a keen interest in women's representation and gender equity in Rwanda and Uganda immediately after the transitional period and women's movement in these countries were able to access the party leadership, voice their demands, create a new discourse around women's rights, and resist traditional authorities (Goetz, 2003a; Burnet, 2008). The inclusion of women in politics through use of quotas, women's active engagement in incorporating the gender equality clause in the constitution Uganda and South Africa; changes in inheritance law in Rwanda, all happened during this period. In South Africa, during the period of transition from the apartheid regime, women had the most voice and influence on the political leadership

and the state machineries (Fester, in press). In Bangladesh, the women's movement exerted the most influence during the decade of 1990s when transition from an authoritarian phase took place. Women were able to gender mainstream the national five year development plans, ensure direct elections for women in the local government, and secure legal/ policy changes on violence against women (Nazneen and Sultan, 2010). In Chile, Brazil, Mexico, the anti authoritarian movement created scope for large scale activism by women, particularly they mobilized demanding answers for those who had disappeared under the authoritarian regimes (Kemp et al., 1995; Lamas et al., 1995; Soares et al., 1995). This created 'political entitlement' which women's groups claimed during the transitional phase to democracy, however, the space become fragmented as these countries entered a more stable phase women formally enter policy spaces (Molyneux, 2001; Basu, 2010).

However, there are times when the state and political elites have taken an active interest in particular interest in women's welfare without a widespread demand from women's groups. For example, the Bangladesh government introduced the vulnerable group development (VGD) program, a government assistance program that targets rural poor widows and abandoned women. This program started in a context where there was famine and the official rehabilitation program had failed to address the needs of a large number of war widows (Hossain, 2007). The fact that 'patriarchal bargain' (i.e. men being able to honor their role as providers, and the normative order based on it-- Kandiyoti, 1988; Kabeer, 1994) broke down after the war, which then required the state to address provision for war widows/ displaced women in social policy in the post war context in Bangladesh. This social provisioning continued in later years as these became the tool for distributing patronage at the local level. Considering that the local politicians have close and frequent interactions with the population and they require electoral support (elections at the local level are not based on party politics), the politicians have continued with the program.

The international discourses on women's rights and gender equity have played an important role in creating space for women's movement groups to access the state and be consulted on various issues. In the case study countries, for example, in Bangladesh, Rwanda, etc the UN international conferences, CEDAW shadow reporting processes, etc have created the need for the state to consult women's movement on these issues/ processes so that they are able to legitimize state's positions (Tripp, 2003; Burnet, 2008; Nazneen and Sultan, 2010). In fact, discourses are important features of women's (including women's movement) political opportunity framework. Competing ideologies and discourses may influence openings for women's participation in political processes and institutions or place limits on representation of women's claims (Rai, 1996). A key gap in using political settlement literature for understanding the politics of securing gender inclusive development is that the political settlement framework does not include how different ideologies and discourses on gender that influence political and social actors.

4.1.6 What kind of politics enables promotion of women's representation and participation in political processes and institutions?

Analysis of the case study countries shows that there are some common factors that facilitate how gender equity concerns are represented in formal and informal institutions and political processes (see table below). These factors are: a) support for gender equity among senior party officials; b) issue based coalition within women's movements and alliances with CSO; c) strong links between women representatives and

women's movement; d) male allies within state bureaucracy and political parties; e) political opportunity structure that creates space for women's participation and promotion of gender equity. In this section we briefly discuss what may be further researched for unpacking political settlements of securing gender inclusive development.

Invariably, not all of these factors presented below carry the same weight; it varies in different contexts. Support for gender equity among top party officials would carry more weight in contexts where there are single party systems and patronage plays a key role in politics. In order to further our understanding of gendered politics, we need to take into account which factors carry more weight in which context and why.

There are different reasons why women's participation and representation in politics is supported by different actors. For women's rights activists, some women representatives and male political leaders, the support of women's representation and participation is ideological. However, most of the actors, particularly political party leaders, the state, etc have instrumental /pragmatic reasons for including women in political processes and institutions (such as creation of vote banks, plaudits from international actors for being gender sensitive etc). It is important to unpack these interests and incentives and how these interests are negotiated for understanding whether the measures to include women in politics translate into electoral and policy leverage. It is also important to analyze which women come into politics through affirmative action and other measures, what kind of agendas they pursue and why (see sections 4.1.3).

The nature of political opportunity structures, i.e., the openness of the political institutions to women's demands, the presence of elite allies in different state and political arenas, and whether state represses women's demands, all have implications for women's effective participation in political processes. Our analysis shows that coalitions and alliances and strong links between women's representatives and the women's movement may have different degrees of influence in promoting women's interests in politics depending on the nature of the political opportunity structures. Comparative studies of how different political opportunity structures influence the ability of the coalitions and alliances in promoting gender equity interests may be useful for unpacking political settlement from a gender perspective.

In addition, the discussion in the previous section on case study countries shows that during critical moments of state formation, women were able to claim political inclusion because of their participation in independence or anti- colonial or anti-authoritarian struggles and armed conflicts. Women's roles in these struggles created 'legitimized' entitlements for their inclusion into politics/ and representative institutions. For India and South Africa, women's active participation and role in sustaining the national struggles influenced how women came to demand inclusion in electoral bodies or political institutions when the both of these nation states were reforming political structures (Agarwal, 2011). In Rwanda and Nepal, women's participation in armed conflict provided legitimacy for claiming equal constitutional rights and also for quotas in the system in the post conflict scenario (Burnet, 2008; Tamang, 2004). In Bangladesh, Chile, Uganda, Brazil, Mexico transition to democracy and women's participation in anti-authoritarian struggles created scope for women to demand inclusion in political institutions (Nazneen and Sultan, in press; Goetz and Hassim, 2003; Waylen, 1997; Soras, 1995; Basu, 1995). Case study analysis of how women gain political entitlements in the first place during moments of state formation, and how the nature of this entitlement influences their inclusion into politics may be useful for unpacking gendered nature and impact of political settlement from a gender perspective.

Table 4.2: Factors that enable women's participation and representation in political processes and institutions in ESID countries

Countries	Factors that enable women's participation and inclusion						
	Support among top party leadership	Coalition within women's movement/ and alliances with other Civil society organizations including grassroots	Strong Links between women's movement and women representatives/ presence of male allies	Women's movement's ability to resist traditional elites	International discourse creates legitimacy for women's participation and representation	Transitional context creates space for women's inclusion (democratic transition; post revolutionary; post independence)	Support among bureaucrats
Nepal	Strong rhetoric within the Maoist party for women's participation	Broad coalition among women's groups, however ethnic/caste/ class interests are not effectively addressed in terms of the electoral system envisaged	The links between mainstream women's movement groups and the Maoists not strong.	Women's participation in Maoist movement strengthened their position and ensured their legitimacy to make demands for change, which allowed them to contest traditional elites	Well established in Nepal, which created scope for debating women's inclusion in politics.	Post-conflict; new constitution being formulated, which created scope for debating gender power relations at home/also also in other institutions. Women's participation in the armed struggle created a sense that the new state owed women.	Some support but influenced by class/ caste /ethnic interests
Bangladesh	Women's seats created to strengthen party position and gain legitimacy with international actors	Strong coalitions within the women's groups and alliances but plagued by internal struggle	Ineffective links with political parties, very little influence	Women's participation in politics was not resisted by traditional elite; male resistance to direct elections and other forms of affirmative action exists	UN decade created scope; CEDAW used to create an alternative discourse promote women's participation in politics	Democratic transitions/ state repression on other political activities, and women's participation in the struggle for democracy created space for raising women's concerns in the post authoritarian period.	Existence of femocrats to promote women's participation

India	Some political leaders have strong commitment to gender equity	Strong coalitions within women's movement	Not very effective links with mainstream political parties, although post independence women's movement had strong claims over Congress for their role in national struggle. Some of the right political parties have strong links with women's wings, however their gender ideology does not focus on promoting gender equity.	Women's representation in the national parliament became debated as class/ caste and how it translates into gains for these identity based groups became a key issue	UN decade and the work of CSWI created a strong focus on women.	Post independence period—impetus for modernization created scope for promoting women's interests. Women's participation in the independence struggle created political entitlements for women. Political repression during emergency period created scope for focus on women	Existence of femocrats
Uganda	Support among NRM; NRM had incentives to have women as vote banks	Strong coalitions within the movement and alliances with other CSO. However women did not focus on institutionalizing the electoral gains. Cross party caucus became weak.	Fragile links now; initially NRM was supportive later NRM patronage created difficulties for women's movement groups.	Resisted by traditional elites; especially about women's participation in parliament and local government –which dilutes power of the traditional elite	International discourses and donor funding for gender equity create incentive. Also increase legitimacy	Transition from dictatorship created scope for renegotiation around gender.	Existence of femocrats
Rwanda	Support from Kagame and RPF; strong rhetoric on gender equity. Women not	Cross party caucus existed during transition	Strong links between women's movement and RPF women's representatives	Women's inclusion resisted by traditional elites. Women's participation in the RPF and the	The international discourses, esp Beijing and PFA had a significant	Post conflict situation created scope for negotiating women's inclusion in politics. Large	Existence of femocrats, and also inclusion of women in large numbers in bureaucracy. Women were willing to

	perceived as a threat to RPF.			resistance created scope for women to push for inclusion; created credentials	influence in reshaping the gender equity agenda. Also created incentive for the state to address these to appear Rwanda had move past the tragedy, help from donors and UN to reshape institutions	number of war widows and also women's involvement in RPF translated into the need to change existing gender power structures. constitution	promote gender equity.
South Africa	ANC strongly endorsed gender equity concerns and women's representation	Women's National Council played a key role; later cross party caucus played key role. Alliances with other social movements	Strong links with political parties, particularly the ANC. Also male allies within political parties	Resisted by traditional elite; esp devolution at the local level	international discourse used to increase profile of women's demands.	Transition from apartheid created scope for raising gender issues and changes in institutional arrangements for women representation. Women's participation in the anti-apartheid struggle scope for women to claim political entitlements	Existence of femocrats

4.2 Gendered policy process: securing commitment to a gender equity agenda in development policy processes

In this section we investigate efforts to institutionalize a gender equity agenda in development policy processes through country case studies that span nearly two and half decades, from the 1990s to mid 2000. This period has witnessed remarkable global and national economic and political changes that not only have gender specific impact but have contributed to the fragility of these efforts. These include macro-economic structural adjustment policies and reforms requiring social sector spending cuts, and economic liberalization policies that have drawn women into new forms of employment but excluded them from social welfare entitlements; debt servicing constraints and low revenue generation have meant that resources for equity oriented policies have been scarce; concerns to secure male employment have taken precedence; weak administrative capacity and poor governance has weakened implementation of policy decisions; the growing compromise of the state with fundamental religious groups in some countries has demonstrated that women as a political constituency carry relatively less weight despite national secular principles (Goetz 1995; UNRISD, 2005; Mukhopadhay , 2007).

The commitment to a gender equity approach in development policy is not an easy process to unpack. As Kabeer (1994, pp: xi) points out development is a difficult concept to define since "it means different things to different people", so adding a gender analytical lens to it complicates this further. And, since development has for long been "about men, by men for men", the male bias in thinking about development and male dominance in the national development policy arena remain genuine hurdles in efforts to promote a gender equity approach in many national contexts. Moreover, gender equity and more recently gender justice within development process are not intuitively perceived, neither are they uncontested concepts like poverty reduction, or human development or even efficiency, these concepts are passionately debated even among gender advocates and feminist activists. Hence, the ideas around gender equity have to be presented in a palatable and acceptable form to the dominant stakeholders, and arguments for inclusion have to be couched in the logic and language of development planners who are mostly men. Language and discourse thus constitutes a very important tool in the politics of embedding the gender equity approach into development policy processes.

International events and global economic trends have also played a relatively greater role in shaping national debate and politics around gender equality and inclusive development compared to other development debates (perhaps with the exception of poverty reduction). The UN Decade for Women (1976-1985), Beijing 1995 and Beijing +5 have all featured in very important ways in the national discourse on WID/GAD and implementation of 'gender mainstreaming' in development in a wide range of developing countries. The International Conference on Population and Development (ICPD) 1994 was a watershed event that led many national governments struggling with large and growing populations to recognize women's reproductive health and rights and to make formal commitment to integrate them into national health policy. Later, global trends in the flow of capital, trade and labor brought into sharper focus the inadequacies of gender mainstreaming strategy to ensure gender justice and raised concern about women's rights as workers and their entitlements to welfare on an equal footing with male workers in newly industrialized countries in the global South.

In this paper all development policy is seen to have an inescapable effect upon women whether intended or not, since all policies, whether social or macro economic, "are always filtered through social institutions that are gendered—families, households,

and communities and labor markets and markets" (Razavi, 2007). However, gender effects of macro policies are not easy to comprehend unless scrutinized using a gender analysis framework (for example, industrial policy, monetary and fiscal policy, national budgets, communication and transport policy, and so on). Even when the effects can be conceptually thought through, these are not necessarily measureable through the conventional methods and outcomes used by planners. Thus, although impacts of macro policies upon women and the poor can be identified in theory, unless policies and program interventions directly involve households and women as clients, beneficiaries or users it is extremely difficult to identify effective and practical entry points for actions and interventions aimed at reducing gender inequality and redressing gender injustices. Hence, we shall limit our interrogation to policies that have a direct bearing upon women where outcomes are easier to assess from a gender equality/gender justice angle, in other words, concentrate on what is commonly known as 'social policy'.

We have selected country case studies broadly following the chronology of the emergence of women as a distinct category in the development discourse and development policy[43]. Although we will be in no position to make generalized claims, we selected case studies that were undertaken with some common comparative framework in mind, in the hope that this would facilitate drawing out patterns and commonalities in the processes through which a gender equity agenda becomes embedded in national development policy. For this review the case studies were analyzed using two additional lenses: first, women's 'political effectiveness' in the process of institutionalization (women's access and presence among the actors and their influence in embedding or institutionalizing gender equity interests and policy accountability to women); and second, evidence of a 'political settlement' in this process (actors, interests and governing institutions); see framework in Annex 2. Because this was not the objective of the original case studies, the analysis has been hindered by the unevenness of information on both these counts across case studies. The results of the analysis are summarized in Annex Table 2.

The main WID goal following the UN Decade for Women was to make women visible as economic producers and to integrate them into the development process more productively. This would require development planners to address the issue of "inequality in women's access to and participation in the definition of economic structures and policies and the productive process itself" (UN Commission on the Status of Women). The most promising strategy to achieve this was seen as 'gender mainstreaming' through the establishment of national bureaucracies to improve public accountability to women in the development process. The **first** set of country cases studies therefore examines the politics of gender mainstreaming in four developing countries (Bangladesh, Uganda, Morocco, Chile) that attempted to institutionalize gender into the development process during the mid to late 1990s (Goetz, 1995). The fifth case study from Kerala (India) examines the gender mainstreaming process as part of decentralized local self government (George, 2006)[44].

But while arguments about women's economic roles were persuasive enough to place women and efficiency firmly on the development agenda, they came at a time

---

[43] The emergence of women as a recognized constituency in the development effort and changes in the policy discourse has been very comprehensively documented and analyzed by Kabeer (1994).
[44] These sets of cases are largely built based on analysis presented in Goetz (1995) and George (2006). It also supplements the data from other sources, such as, Goetz and Hassim (2003); Goetz (2003a); Waylen (1997); Pittman and Naciri (in press).

"when the ability of whole nations to act as sovereign nations was under threat. ... Program of economic austerity, privatization and trade liberalization were made the conditions under which international financial agencies were prepared to lend to countries in need of loans" (Kabeer, 1994, pp: 8). The "rollback" of the state and absence of adequate social protection compounded women's continuing economic vulnerability in a globalizing world where markets and macro economic flows of trade and capital continued to be gender insensitive.

The **second** set of cases, undertaken in the backdrop of two decades of population control policies in poor countries with rapidly growing populations with the objective of increasing the use of modern contraceptives by married women, examines efforts of national governments to address women's reproductive health and rights in the context of health sector reforms. Five case studies from Egypt, Indonesia, Tanzania, Mexico and South Africa review progress made in advancing the reproductive health agenda of the 1994 ICPD Program of Action[45], focusing on how each country acted in endorsing different elements of the comprehensive reproductive health approach (Forman and Ghosh, 2000)[46].

The **third** set of case studies deal with welfare entitlements of women workers in the export oriented manufacturing industries. Four case studies from South Korea, China, Mexico and India explore whether women's employment in the export oriented manufacturing industries have been able to create the conditions for their 'social citizenship' by enhancing their social rights and welfare entitlements (pensions, unemployment insurance, health care) (Razavi, 2007)[47].

4.2. 1 Integrating gender into state development processes (mainstreaming)

Insufficient institutional mechanisms within national governments to promote the advancement of women have prompted the establishment of gender units within national government machineries (UN Commission on the Status of Women). The hope was that these units would be able to pursue their mandate of creating access or 'integration' of a WID/GAD agenda within a range of development policy making and project implementation institutions, primarily state agencies, a project commonly called 'mainstreaming'. The case studies examining the efforts at institutionalizing gender and development (GAD) concerns in state development policy processes included poor and middle income countries all sharing the common experience of chronic dependence on international funding and subject to World Bank (WB) and International Monetary Fund (IMF) macro-economic structural adjustment policies during 1980s and 1990s[48]. The

---

[45]The ICPD PoA required an explicit policy shift from the "exclusive focus on demographic concerns to one that holds the well-being of individual women and men at the center of sustainable development" (UN, 1995).

[46] Empirical data for these set of cases are largely drawn from Forman and Ghosh edited book (2000). There are different country chapters in this book which draws on different data sources. See Khattab et al., (2000); Palma and Palma, (2000); Bansger, (2000); Hull and Iskander (2000), Kulgman (2000) in this book. However the data here are supplemented by work conducted on population policies and studies (Mundigo, 2000) and benefitted from analysis presented in other feminist work (Kabeer, 1994).

[47] Empirical data collected for these set of country cases are largely drawn from the Razavi (2007). Country cases have been the supplemented by Davin (2001); Ghosh (2001); Razavi (1997); Cornwall and Coleho (2007); and the analysis here benefitted from other feminist work (Meer and Sever, 2004; Mukhapadhya and Singh, 2007).

[48] Adjustment measures and later SWAPs (from mid 1990s) have entailed the promotion of the private sector in service delivery and the shrinking (or rationalization) of public sector ('rollback' of

case study countries include ones that were under military and colonial regimes and went through independence struggles with various degrees of participation by women. The purpose of the examination was to assess the extent to which these efforts improved public accountability to women in the development process, and the picture which emerges is "one of extraordinarily fractured trajectories of institutionalization within public administration" (Goetz 1995, pp: i).

Evidence of institutionalizing gender in government bureaucracy:
Our analysis of the cases indicates that the "mainstreaming" project has been only partially implemented, postponing the transformative project of challenging existing implementation structures and disciplinary biases and embedded bureaucratic interests.

- Women's machineries or WID/GAD units within government, whether inside central policy decision making agencies like the Ministry of Planning or in separate ministries, were established, allowing women access to policy spaces within government
- Spaces were largely precarious and marginalized, failed to produce a 'critical mass' able to articulate voice as a constituency because of low rank and poor technical and analytical capacity
- Policy statements and national program of women's advancement were made at the top policy levels, but these were reduced to rhetoric due to poor implementation at sectoral levels (inadequate resources, gender-sensitive policy proposals were rarely traced through to actual budgetary implications and failed to make a direct impact on public expenditure planning process).
- Some capacity for strategic analysis and planning was developed as indicated by efforts of preparing gender-sensitive sectoral policies.
- WID/GAD units within government were likely to collaborate with gender sensitive NGOs on concerns that were marginalized by development planners (youth, children, adolescents) and in conducting research, but generally had weak links with national female constituency and women's organizations, keeping them insensitive to needs of national female citizenship.
- Compliance with guidelines about gender sensitive projects and financial allocations to projects that directly benefit women and marginalized groups was evident within local level planning machinery possibly due to critical numbers of elected women participation in planning.

Women's political effectiveness:
- Women were not generally able to gain access to high policy decision making levels within government through existing mechanisms of promotion and appointment leading to absence of a 'critical mass' at those levels.
- 'Critical' presence of women was possible when women were appointed to high positions within bureaucracy and WID unit was established centrally and not as separate women's unit (Uganda, Chile).

---

the state). The implications of these processes on women and men have been differentiated within countries and also uneven across the developing world depending upon the nature and extent of cuts in social sector spending and on women's ability to access labor market opportunities.

- 'Critical' presence of women outside government had influence when there was strong link of WID unit with feminists and activists (Chile).
- At local levels women's access was possible through reservations, and influence was facilitated by close monitoring of participation of women representatives in local planning process (India).

The PRS process initiated in 1998 and that occupied the imagination and interest of the international development community in the new millennium afforded another opportunity to mainstream gender in the planning process. In 2001 the World Bank itself undertook review of a sample of 15 I-PRSPs and four PRSPs, analyzing how gender issues were addressed in poverty diagnosis, selection of priority public actions, the definition of targets and indicators for M&E, and participatory consultation processes (World Bank, 2001b) Less than half of the documents included a detailed discussion of gender issues: 42% for poverty diagnosis, 31% for selection of public actions, 10% for M&E, and 21% for participatory consultations (World Bank, 2001, pp: 338). A significant proportion had no discussion on gender at all. There was no discussion on gender for urban development, transport and energy sectors; and limited discussion for agriculture, land rights and rural development, environment and natural resource management, safety nets and food security, water and sanitation and violence.

The apparent rationale of the IFIs for supporting country PRSPs was that gender sensitive development strategies contribute significantly to both economic growth and equity objectives. However, the real rationale was the growing belief that gender inequality had become more costly for economic growth in a globalizing world. The 'missed opportunity' of the PRS process is evident from another review of 30 completed PRSPs which concluded that national governments were "heavily constrained, especially with respect to macro-policy. The fact that the content of PRSPs is very similar to previous adjustment packages suggests that little real change has occurred through this process. Moreover, some large IFI program are unaffected by the process" (Stewart and Wang, 2003).

4.2.2 Paid work and women's access to social rights and welfare entitlements

Women have entered paid work in rising numbers since the early 1980s in response to increased demand for women workers in the export sectors, notably in low skilled manufacturing in garments, footwear and electronics. Women also took up casual and informal sector paid work in the face of declining real wages and imposition of user fees for health and education services in the context of reforms. Historically (in the West), social rights (pensions, unemployment benefits and insurance) were initially created and designed with full time male workers in mind, so that women's access to social benefits was mediated through their relationships to men (Razavi 2007, pp: 59). In industrialized countries women's increasing presence in the workforce possibly led to rethinking social benefits, eg parental leaves and maternity leaves. But what has happened in those countries where social policies are less institutionalized, and social protection (from income insecurity) largely falls under the purview of the family? In particular, has women's entrance into export oriented manufacturing industries created the conditions of their being recognized as citizens of developing countries with social welfare entitlements?

The newly industrializing countries have developed their own versions of social policy aimed at income security of industrial workers, although not necessarily based

upon the models of European welfare states[49], but concerns with whether these have been inclusive of women was not evident. The 1997-98 financial crisis highlighted the exclusionary effects of economic policies of the 1990s (fiscal austerity, openness of economy to trade, investment and finance) and prompted a shift towards more inclusive forms of social welfare in these countries. But whether the design of these 'surrogate' social policies were able to overcome traditional forms of gender based social exclusion remains unclear. Research on gendered outcomes in relation to women's employment in export oriented manufacturing industries has tended to focus on gender based wage gaps, gender subordination and women's agency in the work place and homes of workers, and working conditions, absence of safety precautions and ban on workers right to mobilize. Questions related to social policy have been largely absent (Razavi 2007, pp: 62).

The four case studies examine experiences with respect to design of social policy for workers protection and the impact on providing work and survival security to women workers in the era of globalization. The general conclusion from a reading of the cases is: the outcomes of policy efforts of the newly industrializing countries to universalize social welfare entitlements are at best ambivalent, and at worst highly gender stratified. The general shift to contribution based social insurance militates against women workers in export oriented manufacturing industries because of gendered nature of restructured labor force, but social policy design is unable or unwilling to tackle embedded gender asymmetries (family responsibility for income security, burden of care work upon women, male breadwinner). Private enterprises cannot be relied upon to provide worker benefits or income security, so states will have to take responsibility for universal coverage of welfare entitlements.

Gender equity outcomes:
- Young women from rural have areas gained access to paid employment outside agriculture, but jobs are concentrated in low pay low technology assembly plants, hence precarious, uncovered by new social insurance systems
- Young women are able to escape rural poverty and contribute to parental household income security through remittance, also likely to attain higher bargaining position in family
- Intensified labor protests around wage and social welfare issues give precedence to male workers, women workers interests not represented
- Uneven implementation and coverage of new social insurance schemes by region, size of firms, between special economic zones and other areas, discriminates against women
- Contribution based social insurance model can be made more inclusive, including of women, if contributions (of those with weaker capacity to pay) are subsidized by the state.

Women's political effectiveness:

No direct information was available from case studies. Cases from India and South Korea provide some evidence that the groundwork for the adoption of universal and inclusive social policy for workers' protection by the state can be laid by social and

---

[49] These states developed a range of 'surrogate' social policies that were not necessarily European style welfare state type of policies (Razavi 2007, pp: 63).

women's movements mounting pressure to place such requirements on the electoral agenda of governments.

4.2. 3 Reproductive health and rights in the context of health sector reform

ICPD PoA (1994), to which 180 countries were signatories, represents a transformation in thinking about reproductive health and rights, from a narrow regulatory approach (biomedical strategies, i.e. contraceptive use as the best solution to rapid population growth) to a humanistic and gender equitable agenda centered on peoples' health and rights, stressing "the importance of advancing gender equality, equity and the empowerment of women, and women's ability to control their own fertility" (Forman and Ghosh 2000, pp: 2). A comprehensive RH approach to health and family planning service delivery, with commitments from national governments for financing one-third, was identified as the most effective strategy to achieve this. Thus, following up on how individual countries have performed on this commitment provides a unique vantage point for examining the process through which a gender equity agenda in the health sector becomes institutionalized (or fails to be).

At the time when the five case studies were done, all the countries shared the common problem of rapid population growth, seen as a major development constraint, and high levels of poverty, and had pre-existing national family planning program aimed to increase contraceptive use. Women were the primary targets of the interventions, seen as beneficiaries of family planning services (men's involvement was rare). The case studies trace the processes through which each country attempted to adopt the comprehensive reproductive health approach within existing public health systems. We have attempted to revisit the cases from our perspective of women's access, presence and influence in this process, and identify outcomes that reflect the extent to which a gender equity agenda is evident.

The general conclusion from a re examination is that despite strong national commitment to the need to address gender equity concerns in population and health sector development, implementation has been partial and fragmented. The ideology anchoring the RH agenda, namely the recognition of human rights and how they apply to reproductive and sexual health and rights, and the centrality of gender equity in reproductive and sexual decisions and access to resources, has all but disappeared in the process of translation to national level realities, financial constraints and implementation capacity. As a well known demographer noted in 1998 "How far a country's population sector will move from the pre-ICPD situation will depend upon the basis on which resources for the population sector are mobilized and the way these funds are allocated" (Mundigo 2000, pp: 282).

Gender equity outcomes:
- National commitment to a comprehensive RH approach replacing narrow family approach was evident at the highest policy levels, but appeared not to have permeated down to levels of financing and implementation (except SA).
- National RH strategy or program was prepared and some efforts at implementing integrated services were undertaken (especially in countries that had to comply with health sector SWAPs).
- Basic/essential services package covering both primary health and family planning at grassroots level was a very useful tool for integration, and to reach underserved women and children

- More attention in service delivery on previously neglected RH concerns like STDs, infertility, unsafe abortions, adolescent RH, sexual health, domestic violence
- Restrictions on legal abortions remained in most countries

Women's political effectiveness:
- Women's access within state policy processes through the bureaucracy is limited from what is discernible from the limited information, and women have very little influence on implementation and financing.
- Women have some token representation within state machineries through political party affiliations (wives of military and senior officers) so that the ruling party can maintain hold over the gender equity agenda.
- Women (researchers, activists, NGOs) have critical presence and influence on policy and strategy formulation through access to 'invited' spaces where they can participate effectively, but this does not get translated into actual implementation process.

4.2.4 From inclusion to influence: political (and other) conditions that enable integration of gender equity concerns into policy decision making processes

This section draws out the factors enabling and constraining the integration of gender equality concerns in development policy processes in each of the three sectors: women's machineries within government, health and population and social welfare and protection.

The process of integration of gender equity agenda for inclusive development from women's inclusion to influence (political effectiveness) varies according to context, but the following factors in different combinations feature significantly: top leadership and traditional power holders in the existing political context, whatever that may be; the state and its bureaucracy, especially women in important positions and champions ; women's movements, civil society, coalitions and academics; grassroots women's mobilizations; and transnational actors and international development agencies.

Role of top leadership, elite, traditional power holders

The case studies confirm that top leadership (head of government, head of ruling party) can put pressure and effectively ensure that a gender equity agenda is prioritized and institutionalized into state policy processes within the embedded power structure and male dominance of bureaucracies worldwide. Legal and constitutional guarantees for human rights and equality can help in this effort but are not enough, particularly if legislation is on the basis of what is seen as desirable social outcomes rather than on what is implementable on the ground. Top leadership can be instrumental in increasing women's access to high policy positions within government through critical appointments, but there is a danger of politicization of women's interests by the ruling party which alienates women's organizations and the independent women's movement. Top leadership can also undermine gender equity agenda by tacit promotion of and support to policy that has adverse gender impacts due to external donor pressure and to attract foreign investment. Traditional authority structures (elites, aristocrats, intellectuals, religious leaders both Islamic and Christian, village chiefs) and big business can wield sufficient power compelling top leadership to compromise on policy to promote women's entitlements and rights (sexual and abortion rights, welfare entitlements for

women workers). But there is a gap in knowledge about perceptions and commitment of traditional power holders to gender equity in development policy.

Role of state and bureaucracy

Although the role of the state has been problematized (structural adjustment, how it views women as a constituency, the public private divide, increasing alliances with religious groups, and so on) the state remains the critical institution for the promotion of women's rights and gender justice in the contexts of poverty, global financial flows and rising religious fundamentalism. The state still carries "the role of public authority in underwriting the asymmetrical distribution of resources and values between women and men and hence the importance of improving the quality of the accountability of public institutions to their female constituencies" (Goetz, 1995). In other words, for marginalized women the state provides perhaps the only means of having a voice in gendered 'political settlements'.

The case studies reveal that government bureaucracies generally view the inclusion of gender issues in policy on efficiency grounds since they believe bypassing women would be costly for development (and accompanying the democratic project), and in some cases to project the image of a modern state giving appropriate attention to welfare of its citizens including women, rather than on the grounds of women's rights and entitlements as citizens. By and large embedded gender asymmetries in social and economic relations in society (codified in the male breadwinner role) are implicitly supported by states and infiltrate the design of social policy. Even strong state structures that have in the past guided the direction and pace of development and strictly governed markets have yielded to forces of globalization and privatization (China, S Korea). Endemic poverty, surplus labor, low reservation wage of female workers and women's lack of mobilization help to reinforce governments' ambivalent stance regarding women's rights and gender justice. But now and then development and anti poverty program designed on the basis of women's efficiency grounds as birth controllers or as managers of low income households or as contributors to family survival, can directly benefit women and reduce gender inequality almost unintentionally, but these policy processes are little researched.

On the whole, the bureaucracy emerges as a serious stumbling block in state efforts to ensure more inclusive development, and despite co option of language and concepts within ministries there is only selective up take of gender equity concerns (certain sectors, certain levels), driven primarily by availability of donor funding or need to attract foreign investment. Often the rhetoric is locked into policy statements and documents, with very little effective working through to actual financial allocations and structural reforms. Hence good intentioned policies remain un-implementable on grounds of 'overriding' concerns with debt servicing, alternative demands for scarce resources, inadequate capacity of women's machineries, resistance to reforms for accountability and transparency. Quotas and reservations for women in bureaucracy have increased women's access to policy processes but not influence as these are not backed up by sufficient legal and moral authority and tend to stigmatize women in civil service. But there are also instances of champions within ministries who are gender sensitive and alliances with male colleagues who make efforts to make space for women's participation in policy processes, but these are often unsustainable since by and large gender sensitization training although common is not effective in the absence of monitoring and incentives.

Role of women's organizations, movements, coalitions, civil society and academics

The roles of women's organizations in the process of mainstreaming gender equity concerns in development policy are not very well documented. The case studies reveal that in contexts where women's political participation is sufficiently effective this provides credibility and legitimacy to their participation in policy processes, and even bureaucratic resistance can be tackled. A vibrant women's movement with strong links with civil society and feminist academics can influence social policy on health and welfare entitlements and mount pressure on governments to declare socially desirable outcomes (South Korea, India). In other situations women's organizations find entry into policy processes through consultative processes in invited spaces, where the best outcome would be contribution to policy formulation (South Africa, Uganda), and the worst outcome would be marginalization or presence without voice and influence. However, the lack of sufficient attention to the terms on which women can participate often indicates absence of commitment on the part of planners. It is well recognized that what happens when women enter institutions or organizational space is critical to influence: rules of engagement and deliberation, structured around the physical and social needs of those who designed the rules in the first place i.e. men, are hardly ever altered so that women's presence is translated into influence. Thus, accountability failures abound, whether in authoritarian states, or in democratic states, or even in post apartheid South Africa, because of strong political economy relationships and consensus shaping the particular patterns of public spending and mechanisms of accountability in specific contexts. The significance of broader social movements and women's coalitions and alliances to put pressure on these political compacts (leadership, states agencies and bureaucracies, and traditional power holders) to achieve desired socially just and gender equitable outcomes indicates that ability, capacity and resources to organize and mobilize ordinary citizens and especially the female constituency is essential.

The role of transnational actors and international bureaucracies

In section 2.1 we discussed how transnational actors within international bureaucracies and aid agencies (UN bodies, WB, IMF, ILO) used diverse strategies and tactics to include women's interests[50] into the development agendas of their respective organizations. The case studies illustrate how this impact or influence filtered down to the national level through the vehicle of the UN bodies and the UN Decade for Women and the many conferences like the ICPD and Beijing. Both the ICPD in 1994 and Beijing Conference in 1995 were landmarks in terms of setting a global policy framework to advance gender equality and legitimizing the integration of women's interests into national development agendas. For example, The UN set in motion exercises for establishing national machineries that would respond to women's needs in development and poverty reduction and national statistics offices that would generate gender disaggregated data to highlight the gender gap in accessing the benefits of development. Similarly, pressure was exerted to reform national health policies that

---

[50] Being aware that 'women's interests' is a highly contested term, we nevertheless use it here to mean those strategies and approaches that are used to end women's oppression and subordination.

would integrate reproductive health needs and rights of women, men and families with the goal of slowing population growth which was essential for socio economic development and growth. The policy shift in the IFIs since the late 1980s towards greater attention on social policy, poverty reduction and community participation was also more conducive to integrating women's interests into development agendas of national governments. These actions have in the least shaped national policy environments into being more inclusive of women's interests in national policy formulation, and in some cases allowed women to gain a foothold in public policy arenas and in public administration. The availability of resources from international aid agencies for women's development have in many cases provided the first opportunity for women at national levels to participate in policy processes, however token these may have been (Goetz, 1995).

Women in critical and important positions within state machineries

The case studies have reaffirmed the critical importance of women advocates in influential positions within state bureaucracies to transform the policy environment and policy processes, and achieve gender equality outcomes. In contexts where women have entered policy arenas and public administration by virtue of their political activism, women have been placed in fairly high positions (although the glass ceiling remains) (Chile, South Africa, Uganda). In these cases women's influence has been greater and more sustained when they have been able to maintain strong links with national female constituency and the broader women's movement (Uganda, India). The influence of women gender advocates in high positions is curtailed, however, by the fact that, by and large, they continue to operate in an "uneasy relationship with neoliberal advocates of market led growth" (Razavi 1997, pp: 1111). The inevitable outcome is that the content of the gender equality agenda has often had to be "watered down" (Tanzania, Indonesia, Bangladesh). The other constraining factor is when women's appointments to high positions are 'political', reliance on political party support makes the WID vulnerable to political fortunes (Uganda, Bangladesh).

Bottom up citizen practices and collective actions

Collective struggles of women at the grassroots have the potential for influencing institutions such as the household, some segments of the market, local government bodies and frontline bureaucrats (Meer and Sever, 2004; Hossain, 2009). Activities like awareness raising, campaigns, local mobilizations and protests, participation in invited spaces, even training, are examples of women organizing in both formal and informal arenas, which are in effect citizenship practices that create pressure on the state for accountability (Cornwall and Coelho, 2007). These grassroots collective actions are a means to challenge the public/private divide in policy discourse and state action that allows matters such as care and unpaid work, reproductive rights, domestic violence, inheritance to be seen as matters for public policy attention. For example, 'rude' forms of accountability, such as the unorganized, informal pressures that poor citizens exert on local officials are often the most effective way poor people negotiate their entitlements (especially to public services) in Bangladesh, a context where formal systems of accountability are absent (Hossain, 2009, pp:3). Such bottom up action is premised however upon a basic sense of entitlement and rights, that may not exist automatically without the organizing and mobilizing support of NGOs, which limits the role of such forms of collective actions.

The case studies did not provide information on bottom up or grassroots collective action of women except in contexts where women had been active in political struggles (Uganda, South Africa) or in contexts where women were organized through institutional support (Kerala India, and SEWA also India, Chile). Clearly, women at the grassroots need support for organization and mobilization if they are to play a role as agents and political actors in the policy arena, and they require critical information and awareness regarding entry points into decision making and policy dialogues.

Table 4.3: Factors that enable women's political effectiveness in policy processes in case study countries and sectors

Country and sector	Context Women's participation in political struggles, traditional power holders	Factors					Gender equality outcomes
		Women in influential positions within state	Political commitment of top leadership, champions	Women's movement, civil society, coalitions	Grassroots women's mobili-zation	Trans national actors, international agencies	
Gender mainstreaming through establishment of women's machineries within state							
Bangladesh	+ --	+	+	++		++	+
Uganda	++	+++	++	++	++	++	++
Chile	+	++	+	++			++
Morrocco	+	--				++	+
India Kerala	++	++	+	++	++		++
Social welfare entitlement through social protection policy							
India	+		+	++	+		+
S Korea	--	++		++	+		+
China	--						--
Mexico	--		--				-- +
Reproductive health and rights through reforming health policy							
Mexico			+	+		++	++
Egypt	--		+	+		++	+ --
Indonesia	+ --			+		++	+ --
S Africa	++	++	++	++	+	++	++
Tanzania	--		+	++	+	++	+ --

Notes: + indicates positive role of the factor; -- indicates negative role of the factor

An examination of Table 4.3 indicates that the context (characterized by women's participation in political struggles and the influence of traditional power holders) matters in shaping the trajectory from women's access to influence in policy processes, and that gender outcomes are likely to be sector specific, but less likely to be context specific. The following summary points emerge with respect to women's access, presence, and influence inside state machinery:

- Women in influential positions was not a very common feature of decision making arenas within state, with the exception of gender mainstreaming projects, which could have contributed to the generally positive outcomes in this sector. It must be remembered, however, that positive outcomes in this sector are limited to establishment of women's bureaucracies in national governments, but not necessarily their effectiveness in gender inclusive development.
- Political commitment of top leadership and presence of champions within state bureaucracies have been important for gender equality outcomes.
- The role of transnational actors and international development agencies were also important for gender equality outcomes.

The following summary points emerge with respect to women's access, presence and influence outside state machinery:

- Positive gender outcomes were most commonly associated with strong and vibrant women's movement and their coalitions with civil society, feminist scholars and NGOs.
- Women's grassroots mobilizations were likely to feature more often in contexts where women had been political active.

Section 5: Conclusions

This paper was written to provoke thinking amongst our ESID partners on how taking a gender lens may expand our understanding of political settlements. Based on our analysis of the nature of gendered political institutions and policy making processes in different contexts, what can be said about women's presence and influence in securing inclusive development? Our *post hoc* analysis of the different country cases reveals that the following factors play important roles in determining how gender equity concerns are represented and decided upon in politics and policy making processes. These are:

a) the interests and incentives of the political and social elites in promoting/ obstructing gender equity concerns in political and policy making processes;

b) the relationship and negotiations that take place between the feminist constituency and these actors on gender equity;

c) the political opportunity structures that create or limit space for making claims around gender equity;

d) the discourses around gender which influence the gender ideologies of these different actors.

Undeniably, our analysis is limited both methodologically[51] and empirically,[52] but it shows how different elements of political settlements could be used for understanding both gendered political and policy processes and outcomes (Annex 1). However, we have to ask whether exploring gendered politics of securing inclusive development using a political settlement lens furthers our understanding both theoretically and empirically? The discussion in this section is focused on the following areas. We investigate the possibilities that the political settlement lens offers to strengthen existing gender/ feminist analysis and the research gaps emerging from our analysis? Second, what does incorporating a gender lens help to identify as key gaps within the existing political settlement framework?

Possibilities of political settlement perspective: what are the gaps in gender/ feminist analysis and new questions emerging?

The political settlement perspective allows one to focus both on agency of different actors (including women's political agency) and structures (institutions and how these are gendered); and also the interactions between these elements. This focus on structure, agency and their interaction, makes political settlement a useful perspective for understanding how women as actors are included and women's needs and gender equity concerns are negotiated in politics and policymaking processes and the subsequent outcomes. The table in annex 1 shows how gendered politics and policy making can be interrogated using the different elements of political settlement. A focus on political and social elites (including traditional elites) and their interests and incentives for addressing/ hindering gender equitable policies and development outcome and how different political/institutional arrangements facilitate their power to do so, may help in unpacking the opportunities and limits of women's participation in politics and policy making process, and the possibilities for securing gender inclusive development. Political settlement framework also allows us to identify the challengers or excluded elites who are able to negotiate and redraw the boundaries. The framework allows us to

---

[51] We did not conduct rigorous comparative studies.

[52] Our case studies did not contain data on all the different elements that may be required for understanding political settlement on a particular development/ policy outcome.

develop a template identifying incentives, interests, institutional nature, and where centers of power lie on negotiating gender equity concerns.

Using this lens to analyze gendered politics of securing inclusive development in the developing countries may contribute to furthering our understanding about gender in the Third World politics and development in the following ways.

First, research into women's political representation and policy effectiveness in developing countries has important gaps (Goetz and Hassim, 2003). Research on gender analysis of policies focuses on outcomes of policies on women, for example the impact of health or education policies, etc. These analyses rarely take into account the particular relationships that exist between the state, political and social elites, that leads to certain forms of policies. A political settlement perspective may helpful in unpacking these relationships and why certain forms of policy measures are undertaken.

Second, feminist research on women's representation extensively debates how women are not a homogenous social group and the difficulties this poses in representative democracies or systems for promoting women's interests or gender equity. There is less focus on how, when and why does electoral and policy elites consider women as an important constituency? When and how does women's ability to retaliate electorally and in other ways occur? When and how can women (including women's groups), who in many cases are excluded by elite or non elite actors, through collective mobilization challenge existing political settlements on gender? These issues can be explored through this political settlement perspective.

Third, the gender and development research has focused on the impact of quotas on promotion of gender equity interests. However, there has been less focus on who (which women) comes in through quotas and how that influences policy choices. There is also little research on women in formal political parties and how they negotiate with different political or social constituencies on gender equity concerns. A political settlement perspective may allow for a more nuanced link between politics of inclusion and politics of influence, particularly focusing on how women (and men) become critical actors promoting gender equity concerns.

Fourth, much of the development research on gender and women's inclusion in politics does not use a context specific and historical analysis of how women as a collective group were able to secure 'political entitlement', especially during moments if state formation and how this interpretation of entitlements affect women's collective ability to secure inclusive development. A political settlement perspective may be effective in analyzing policy areas by focusing on how women initially gain inclusion and trace these political entitlements effect women's ability to influence and secure inclusive development.

Fifth, feminist research on gender in the Third World has largely focused on the nature and role played by the state in promoting or hindering women's interests or gender equity concerns. Feminists have debated how the post colonial state's emphasis on developmental rhetoric and relative autonomy of the state to act on behalf of women create opportunities for women's participation (Rai, 1996). They have also researched how the weaknesses in a state's ability and corruption hinder gender equitable development. There is also been less focus on the political dimension, partly because of the feminist/ women's anti-pathy towards political parties and institutions (Goetz and Hassim, 2003). The political dimension can be unpacked using a political settlement lens using comparative country studies.

Sixth, while feminists acknowledge that patronage and clientelist politics limits women's political effectiveness and that state's accountability to women (and for promoting gender equity concerns, Goetz and Jenkins, 2005), there are very few

studies that unpack the gender impact of clientelist and patronage based politics, exploring women's representation in politics, policy making and the outcome that results in these contexts.

How does a gender lens strengthen the political settlement perspective?

A gender lens raises important questions and brings in dimensions that may strengthen the political settlement framework. A major challenge in using a political settlement framework to unpack gendered politics of securing inclusive development is that its focus on incentives and interests is based on a rational choice analysis that leaves out the role played by ideologies. Gender ideologies play a key role in motivating behavior of the actors, both of political and social elites, excluded elites, oppositional non-elites and women who may want to contest these ideologies. In fact, competing ideologies and discourses around these ideologies influence the nature of the political opportunity structure within which women's interests and gender equity concerns are negotiated. A question that arises is: whether the framework is able to accommodate this discursive element around gender ideologies?

This above question has relevance for other marginalized groups and non-elite groups if the political settlement perspective is used for capturing bottom-up negotiations around inclusive development. How we think about inclusive development and interpret the needs of marginalized groups and are challenged by the alternative interpretations forwarded by these groups (or those actors who promote their interests) and influence how policies are framed; though these discursive changes may not necessarily lead to a tangible change in policy outcomes.

Second, analysis of how gender inclusive development is secured or not allows for deepening our understanding of the following factors in achieving and sustaining a political settlement, such as actions by non-elite groups, use of bottom up strategies by marginalized/ excluded groups, how participation at the local may create scope for influencing the actors/ discourses at the national policy level, etc. It also creates the possibilities for expanding political settlement's focus on role played by policy coalitions, the significance of informal relations between different actors (intra-elite negotiations, negotiations with excluded elite/ oppositional non-elite) in negotiating an outcome, and the scope for transnational actors in influencing the nature of political settlements, through case study analysis.

A future research agenda and possible methodologies

A future research agenda may include the following areas. How policy coalitions influence and change the gendered nature of political settlements around specific policy areas/ sectors such as education, health, social protection, welfare, labor) may be studied through analyzing strategies used by different groups , including feminists/ or women's groups. These can be researched through comparative sectoral studies either in a single country case or through comparative country cases. Second, as stated before, the majority of the research on gender and clientelist politics has explored the impact of patronage based politics and corruption on women in different state service sectors. The gender impact of clientelist and patronage based politics may be unpacked through exploring women's representation in politics, policy making and outcome that results in these contexts in single country cases and comparative country cases may further our understanding. Through cross sectoral comparative studies in single country cases/ or comparative country cases gendered accountability failures in these contexts

can be explored. Third, through historical analysis examining single country cases, the links between the different forms of women's inclusion into politics leading to different kinds of politics influence and gendered policy/development outcomes may be researched. Once a template has been developed identifying critical factors through single country case study, comparative country studies may be undertaken to further our understanding. Methods may include in-depth interviews with representatives, case studies, and also quantitative methods for profiling the representatives. Fourth, for analyzing the nature of gendered settlements, how women's political entitlements as a collective group which were gained through their participation in politics during state formation or key moments of change lead to different types of policy outcomes can also be traced through historical analysis of single countries or comparative country cases. Methods may include key informant interviews, archival analysis and document analysis. Fifth, case studies in particular sector or policy area may be used for investigating the role played by transnational actors/ and discourses in creating space for the gender equity agenda and influencing the nature of gendered political settlements.

Where are we now?

Undeniably, given that there are no studies that analyze political settlements from a gender perspective in the developing world, research in this area embodies possibilities for generating new knowledge. In this paper we went about addressing this issue in a round-about manner focusing on different bodies of literature that may provide information on different elements of political settlement. However, our discussion on gender politics and policy processes show that there are data gaps that could be usefully addressed by employing this framework and conducting research using different types of methods (see section 4.1.6 , 4.2 and discussion above). In order to move forward we need to set parameters of what is possible. This requires a focus on addressing the dilemmas that arise from what political settlement framework excludes (ideology, discourse, bottom up strategies). Given the context specificity of gendered nature and impact of political settlements the challenge is to develop a general template (as Goetz and Hassim, 2003, had done for gendered representation) that allow us to explore specific country cases and move on towards comparative analysis?

References

Agarwal, B., 2002. 'The hidden side of group behaviour: A gender analysis of community forestry in south Asia'. In: J. Heyer, F. Stewart and R. Thorp, eds. 2002. *Group behaviour and development: Is the market destroying co-operation?* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Agarwal, B., 2011. *Gender and green governance*, Oxford: Oxford university press.

Ahikire, J., 2003. 'Gender equality and local democracy in contemporary Uganda: Addressing the challenge of women's political effectiveness in local government'. In: A.M Goetz and S. Hassim, eds. 2003. *No short cuts to power: African women in politics and policy making*, London: Zed books.

Al-Sharmani, M., (in press). 'Introduction'. In: M.AL Sharmani, ed., *Legal reforms and feminist activism: global processes*, London: ZED books.

Araujo, C., 2010. 'The Limits of Women's Quotas: The Case of Brazil'. In: *IDS Bulletin*, Vol 41, No 5, pp.17-24.

Asia Foundation, 2010. Political Settlements: Implications for International Development Policy and Practice', San Francisco: Asia Foundation. Available at: <http://asiafoundation.org/resources/pdfs/ PoliticalSettlementsFINAL.pdf> [accessed August 30, 2011]

Baden, S. and Goetz, A.M., 1998. 'Who needs [sex] when you can have [gender]? Conflicting discourses on gender in Beijing'. In: C. Jackson and R. Pearson, eds. 1998. *Feminist visions of development: gender analysis and policy*, London: Routledge.

Bansger, M., 2000. Tanzania, in Forman, S. and Ghosh, R., 2000. *Promoting reproductive health: investing in health for development*. Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers Inc.

Basu, A., 1995. *The challenges of local feminisms: women's movement in global perspective*, Boulder, CO: Westview press.

Basu, A., 2010. 'Introduction'. In A. Basu, Ed. *Women's movement in a global era*, Boulder, Co: Westview Press

Beaman, L. et al., 2008. 'Powerful women: does exposure reduce bias?' NBER working paper, series 14198, Landon: Cambridge, MA. Available at: <http://www.nber.org/papers/w14198> [accessed February 15, 2011]

Boserup, E. 1970, *Women's role in economic development,* Allen and Unwin

Burnet, J. E., 2008. 'Gender balance and the meanings of women in governance in post genocide Rwanda', *African Affairs*, 107/ 428. pp:361-386

Charlesworth, H., 2005. 'Not waving but drowning: gender mainstreaming and human rights in the United Nations'. *Harvard Human Rights Journal*, Vol. 18, no. Spring, pp. 1-18.

Chattopadhay, R. and Duflo, E., 2004. 'Women as policymakers: evidence from randomized policy experiment in India'. *Econometrica*, Vol. 72, no. 5, pp. 1409-1443.

Childs, S. and Krook, M.L., 2009. 'Analysing women's substantive representation: from critical mass to critical actors'. *Government and Opposition*, Vol. 44, issue 2, pp. 125-145.

Chowdhury, N., 1994. 'Women in politics', Dhaka: Women for Women.

Cornwall, A. 2005, 'What do buzzwords do for policy? Critical look at 'participation,' 'empowerment' and 'poverty reduction,' *Third World Quarterly*, Vol. 26, Issue 7, pp: 1043-1060

Cornwall, A. and Coleho, V., 2007. *Spaces for change? The politics of citizen's participation in new democratic spaces.* London: ZED books.

Cueva, H., 2004. 'Women in politics what difference does it make? An empirical assessment of the case if abortion law'. MPhil Thesis. Brighton: IDS. (Mimeo)

Davin, D., 2001. 'The impact of export oriented manufacturing on Chinese women workers', (Draft), UNRISD, Geneva. Available at: <http://www.unrisd.org/unrisd/website/document.nsf/ab82a6805797760f80256b4f 005da1ab/ 23b9b6703e326969c1256bb800535363/$FILE/davin.pdf> [accessed July 20, 2011]

Di John, J. and Putzel, J., 2009. Political settlements issues paper, [online] GSRDC, International Development Department, University of Birmingham, UK. Available at: <http://epapers.bham.ac.uk/645/1/EIRS7.pdf> [accessed July 20, 2011]

DiIulio, John D. Jr., 1994. 'Principled Agents: The cultural bases of behavior in a federal government bureaucracy'. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory.* Vol. 4, no. 3, pp: 277-342.

Dovi, S. 2006., Making Democracy Work for Women?' unpublished mimeo.

Fester, G. (in press), 'South Africa: Revolution Protracted or Postponed?'. In: S. Nazneen and M. Sultan, eds. *Voicing demands: feminists reflections on strategies, negotiations and influence*, London: ZED books.

Forman, S. and Ghosh, R., 2000. *Promoting reproductive health: investing in health for development.* Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers Inc.

Frohman, A. and Valdez, T., 1995. 'Democracy in the country and in the home: the women's movement in Chile'. In: A. Basu, ed. *The challenges of local feminisms: Women's movement in global perspective*, Boulder: Westview Press.

George, M.S. 2006. *Towards Participation and inclusion: Mainstreaming gender in decentralisation*, Sage: New Delhi

Goetz, A.M., 1995. 'The politics of integrating gender to state development processes: trends, opportunities and constraints in Bangladesh, Chile, Jamaica, Mali, Morocco and Uganda'. Occasional Paper 2. UNRISD/UNDP, Geneva. Available at: <http://www.unrisd.org/unrisd/website/document.nsf/d2a23ad2d50cb2a280256eb 300385855/ 8856ec9f7738f32a80256b67005b6ad5/$FILE/opb2.pdf> [Accessed August 15, 2011]

Goetz, A.M., 1997a. *Getting institutions right for women in development.* London: ZED books.

Goetz, A.M., 1997b. 'Local heroes: Patterns on field worker discretion in implementing gad policy in Bangladesh'. In: A.M. Goetz, ed. *Getting Institutions Right for Women in Development.* London: ZED books.

Goetz, A.M., 2003a. The problem with patronage: Constraints on women's political effectiveness in Uganda. In: A.M Goetz and S. Hassim, eds. No short cuts to power: African women in politics and policy making. London: Zed books.

Goetz, A.M., 2003b. Women's political effectiveness: A conceptual framework. In: A.M Goetz and S. Hassim, eds. No short cuts to power: African women in politics and policy making. London: Zed books.

Goetz, A.M. and Hassim, S., 2003. No short cuts to power: African women in politics and policy making, London: Zed books.

Goetz, A.M. and Jenkins, R., 2005. 'Reinventing accountability: Making democracy work for human development', New York: Palgrave.

Goetz, A.M. 2007. 'Political cleaners: Women as the new anti-corruption force', *Development and Change*. Vol 38, Issue 1, pp: 87-105

Goetz, A.M. and Nyamu-Musembi, C., 2008. 'Voice and women's empowerment: Mapping a research agenda', Pathways working paper no 2, Brighton: IDS.

Hasle, L., 2003. 'Too poor for rights: Access to justice for poor women in Bangladesh'. *Bangladesh Development Studies.* Vol. XXIX, Nos. 3 and 4, pp: 99-136.

Hassim, S., 2003. 'Representation, participation and democratic effectiveness: Feminist challenges to representative democracy in South Africa'. In: A.M Goetz and S. Hassim, eds. *No short cuts to power: African women in politics and policy making.* London: Zed Books.

Hossain, N., 2007. 'The politics of what works: The case of the vulnerable group development programme in Bangladesh'. CPRC Working Paper no 92, Dhaka: BRAC. Available at: <http://www.chronicpoverty.org/ publications/details/the-politics-of-what-works-the-case-of-the-vulnerable-group-development-programme-in-bangladesh> [Accessed July 30, 2011]

Hossain, N., 2009. 'Rude accountability in the unreformed state: Informal pressure on frontline bureaucracies in Bangladesh'. IDS working paper 319. Brighton: IDS. Available at: <http://www.centreforcivicdrivenchange.org/ fileadmin/Wp319.pdf> [Accessed September 1, 2011]

Hossain, N. and Akhter, S., 2011. 'Gender, power, and politics in Bangladesh: A baseline for upzilla support Bangladesh'. Dhaka: UNDP. Available at: <http://www.swiss-cooperation.admin.ch/bangladesh/en/Home/ Publications> [Accessed September 1, 2011]

Htun, M., 2004. 'Is gender like ethnicity?' *Perspectives in Politics.* Vol. 2, No. 3, pp: 439-458.

Htun, M., 2005. 'Women, political parties, electoral systems in Latin America'. In: Ballington, J. and Karam, A., eds. *Women in parliament and beyond number*. Available at-<http://www.idea.int/publications/wip2/upload/ Latin_America.pdf>. [Accessed August 30, 2011]

Hull, T.H., and Iskander, M. B., 2000, 'Indonesia', in Forman, S. and Ghosh, R., 2000. *Promoting reproductive health: investing in health for development.* Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers Inc.

Jackson, C. and Pearson, R., 1998. *Feminist visions of development: gender analysis and policy.* London: Routledge.

John, M. E., 2007. Women in power: Gender, caster and politics in local governance. Economic and political weekly. Vol 42, no. 39, pp: 3986-3999.

Jones, K. and Jonasdottir, K. eds., 1989. *On the political interests of gender: Developing theory and research with a feminist face.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Kabeer, N., 1994. *Reversed realities: Gender hierarchies in development thought.* London and New York: Verso.

Kabeer, N. and Mahmud, S., 2006. 'Compliance versus accountability: Struggles for dignity and daily bread in the Bangladesh garment industry'. In: P. Newell and J Wheeler, eds. 2006. *Rights, resources and the politics of accountability*. London and New York: Zed books.

Kandiyoti, D., 1988. 'Bargaining with patriarchy'. *Gender and Society*, Vol. 2, no. 3, pp: 274-290.

Kardam, N., 1997. 'Making development organizations accountable: The organizational, political and cognitive context'. In: A.M. Gotez, ed., *Getting Institutions Right for Women in Development.* London and New York: ZED books.

Kawamara-Mishambi, S. and Ovonji-Odida, I., 2003. The 'Lost clause': The campaign to advance women's property rights in the Uganda 1998 land act. In: A.M Goetz

and S. Hassim, eds., No short cuts to power: African women in politics and policy making. London: Zed books.

Kemp, A. et al., 1995. The dawn of a new day: South African feminisms. In: A. Basu, ed. The challenges of local feminisms: Women's movement in global perspective. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Khattab, A.S., El-Fattal, M. and Shorbagi, N.K., 2000, Egypt, In Forman, S. and Ghosh, R., 2000. *Promoting reproductive health: investing in health for development.* Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers Inc.

Klugman, B., Stevens, M. and van den Heever, A., 2000. 'South Africa' in Forman, S. and Ghosh, R., 2000. *Promoting reproductive health: investing in health for development.* Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers Inc.

Kumar, R., 1995. *From Chipko to sati: Contemporary Indian feminist movement. The challenges of local feminisms: Women's movement in global perspective*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Lamas, M. et al., 1995. 'Building bridges: The growth of popular feminisms in Mexico'. In: A. Basu, ed., *The challenges of local feminisms: Women's movement in global perspective*, Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

MacPherson, E., 2008. 'Invisible agents: Women in service delivery reform'. *IDS Bulletin.* Vol. 38, No.6, pp: 38-46.

Mahmud, S., 2007. 'Spaces for participation in health systems in rural Bangladesh: The experience of stakeholder community groups'. In: *A, Cornwall and V. Coleho, eds., Spaces for change? The politics of citizen's participation in new democratic spaces.* London: ZED books.

Mansbridge, J., 1999. 'Should women represent women and black represent blacks?' A contingent "Yes". *The Journal of Politics.* Vol. 61, No. 3, pp: 628-657.

Mbatha, L., 2003. 'Democratizing local government: Problems and opportunities in the advancement of gender equality in South Africa'. In: A.M Goetz and S. Hassim, eds., *No short cuts to power: African women in politics and policy making*. London: Zed books.

McAdam, D. McCarthy, J.D., and Zald, M.N. eds., 2001. *Comparative perspectives on social movements*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Meer, S. and Sever, C., 2004. 'Gender and citizenship overview report', BRIDGE, Brighton: IDS.

Mehta, L., 2006. 'Do human rights make a difference to poor and vulnerable people? Accountability for the right to water in South Africa'. In: P. Newell and J. Wheeler, eds. 2006. *Rights, resources and the politics of accountability*. London and New York: Zed books.

Meintjes, S., 2003. 'The politics of engagement: Women transforming the policy process- domestic violence legislation in South Africa'. In: A.M Goetz and S. Hassim, eds., *No short cuts to power: African women in politics and policy making*. London: Zed books.

Menon, N., 2000. 'Elusive women: Feminisms and women's reservation bill'. Economic *and Political Weekly*. Vol. 35, pp:43-44.

Mohanty, R., 2007. 'Gendered subjects, the state and participatory spaces: The politics of domesticating participation in rural India'. In: A, Cornwall and V. Coleho, eds., *Spaces for change? The politics of citizen's participation in new democratic spaces.* London: ZED books.

Molyneux, M., 1985. 'Mobilization without emancipation: Women's interests, state and revolution in Nicaragua'. In: *Critical social policy*, Vol. 4, no. 10, pp: 59-71.

Molyneux, M and Razavi, S. 2005. 'Beijing plus ten: An ambivalent record on gender justice', *Development and Change*, Vol 36, Issue 6, pp: 983-1010

Molyneux, M., 2001. *Women's movement in international perspective: Latin America and beyond*. London: Palgrave.

Momsen, Janet D. and Townsend, J., eds., 1987. *Geography of Gender in the Third World*. London: Hutchinson.

Moser, C. O.N. 1989. 'Gender Planning in the Third World: Meeting Practical and Strategic Gender Needs', *World Development,* Vol. 17, No. 11 pp: 1799-825

Mukhopadhyay, M. and Singh, N., 2007. 'Gender justice, citizenship and development'. New Delhi and Canada: Zuban and IDRC

Mundigo, A.I. 2000. 'Lesson learned: The need to invest in reproductive health', In Forman, S. and Ghosh, R., 2000. *Promoting reproductive health: investing in health for development*. Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers Inc.

Nazneen, S. and Sultan, M., 2010. 'Reciprocity, distancing and opportunistic overtures: Women's organizations negotiating space and legitimacy in Bangladesh'. *IDS Bulletin.* Vol. 41, No.2 , pp:70-77.

Nazneen, S. and Sultan, M. (in press). *Voicing demands: Feminists reflections on strategies, negotiations and influence*. London: ZED books.

Nazneen, S. and Tasneem, S., 2010. 'A Silver lining: Women in reserved seats in local government in Bangladesh'. *IDS Bulletin.* Vol. 41, No. 5, pp:35-42.

Okin, S.M., 1979. *Women in western political thought*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Palma, Y. and Palma, J.L., 2000, 'Mexico,' in Forman, S. and Ghosh, R., 2000. *Promoting reproductive health: investing in health for development*. Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers Inc.

Pateman, C., 1988. *The sexual contract*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Phillips, A., 1991. *Engendering democracy*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Phillips, A., 1995. *The politics of presence*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Pittman, A. and Naciri, R., (in press). 'Voicing autonomy through citizenship'. In: S. Nazneen and M. Sultan, eds., *Voicing demands: Feminists reflections on strategies, negotiations and influence*. London: ZED books.

Rai, S., 1996. 'Women and the State in the third world: Some issues for debate'. In: S. Rai and G. Livesevley, eds., *Women and the state: International perspectives*. London: Taylor and Francis.

Rai, S., 1997. 'Gender and representation: Women MPs in the Indian parliament 1991-96'. In: A.M. Goetz, ed., *Getting institutions right for women in development*. London: Zed books.

Rai, S. and Livesevley, G. eds., 1996. *Women and the State: International perspectives*. London: Taylor and Francis.

Randall, V., 1998. 'Gender and power: Women engage the State'. In: V. Randall and G. Waylen, eds., *Gender, Politics and the State*. London: Routledge.

Randall, V. and Waylen, G. eds., 1998. *Gender, Politics and the State*. London: Routledge.

Razavi, S., 1997. 'Fitting gender into development institutions'. *World Development*. Vol. 25, No. 7, pp: 1111-1125.

Razavi, S., 2007. 'Does paid work enhance women's access to welfare? Evidence from selected industrializing countries'. *Social politics: International studies in gender, state and society.* Vol. 14, No. 1, spring 2007, pp: 58-92. London: Oxford University Press.

Razavi, S. and Miller, C., 1995. 'Gender mainstreaming: A study of efforts by the UNDP, the World Bank and the ILO to institutionalize gender issues': Occasional paper 4, Geneva: UNRISD. Available at: <http://iiav.nl/epublications /1995/Gender_mainstreaming.pdf> [Accessed September 15, 2011]

Sagot, M., 2010.' Does political participation of women matter: Democratic representation, affirmative action and quotas in Costa Rica'. *IDS bulletin.* Vol. 41, no 5, pp: 25-34.

Sardenberg, C and Acosta, A., (in press). 'Feminisms in Brazil'. In: S. Nazneen and M. Sultan, eds., *Voicing demands: Feminists reflections on strategies, negotiations and influence.* London: ZED books.

Sen, G and Grown, C. 1988. *Development, crises and alternative vision: Third World women's perspective,* London: Earthscan

Skocpol, T., 1992. *Protecting soldiers and mothers: The political origins of social policy in the United States.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Soares, V et al., 1995. 'Brazilian feminisms and women's movement: A two way street'. In: A. Basu, ed., *The challenges of local feminisms: Women's movement in global perspective.* Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Squires, J., 2004. 'Politics beyond boundaries: A feminist perspective'. In: A. Leftwich, ed., *What is politics?.* Cambridge: Polity press.

Staudt, K., 1990. *Women, international politics and development: The bureaucratic mire.* Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Staudt, K., 1997. 'Gender politics in bureaucracies: Theoretical issues in comparative perspective'. In: K. Staudt ed., *Women, international politics and development: The bureaucratic mire.* Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Stewart, F. and Wan, M. 2003, 'Do PRSPs empower poor countries and disempower the World Bank or is it the other way round?' Queen Elizabeth House, University of Oxford

Sultan, M. (n.d) 'Gender in Public Administration in Bangladesh'. UNDP (mimeo)

Tadros, M., 2010. 'Introduction: Quotas-add women and stir?' IDS Bulletin. Vol. 41, No. 5, pp: 1-10.

Tadros, M., 2011. 'Women engaging politically: Beyond magic bullets and motorways'. Brighton: Pathways RPC. Available at: < http://www.pathwaysofempowerment.org/Women_and_Politics_Policy_Paper.pdf > [Accessed April 30, 2012]

Tamale, S., 1999. '*When hens begin to crow: Gender and parliamentary politics in Uganda'.* Kampala: Fountain Publishers.

Tamang, S., 2004. 'The politics of conflict and difference or the difference of conflict in politics: The women's movement in Nepal'. *Feminist Review.* Vol. 91, pp: 48-60.

Tripp, A.M., 2001. 'New political activism in Africa'. *Journal of democracy.* Vol. 12, no. 3, pp: 141-155.

Tripp, A.M., 2003. 'The changing faces of Africa's legislatures: Women and quotas'. In: IDEA (International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance) parliamentary forum conference. 11–12 November 2003, Pretoria, South Africa. Available at: <http://www.quotaproject.org/CS/CS_Tripp_2004.pdf> [Accessed July 30, 2011]

Tripp, A.M., 2004. 'Women's movement, customary law and land rights in Africa: The case of Uganda'. *African Studies Quarterly*, pp: 1-19. Available at: <www.africa.ufl.edu.asq/v7/v7i4a1.htm> [Accessed July 30, 2011]

UNDP, 1995. *Human Development Report,* UNDP

UNIFEM, 2008. 'Progress of World's Women, Who Answers to Women?'. New York: UNIFEM. Available at: <http://hdrnet.org/546/> [Accessed August 15, 2011]

UNRISD/UN, 2005. 'Gender equality: Striving for justice in an unequal world', New York: UNRISD/UN Publication. Available at : <http://www.unrisd.org/80256B3C005BCCF9/(LookupAllDocumentsByUNID) /1FF4AC64C1894EAAC1256FA3005E7201?OpenDocument> [Accessed August 15, 2011]

Waylen, G., 1996. *Gender in Third World Politics.* Buckingham: Open University Press.

Waylen, G., 1997. 'Women's movement, the state, democratic transition: The establishment of SERNAM'. In: A.M.Goetz, ed., *Getting institutions right for women in development.* London: Zed Books.

Weldon, S.L., 2002. 'Beyond bodies: Institutional sources for women in democratic policymaking'. In: *Journal of Politics.* Vol. 64, no. 4, pp: 1153-1174.

World Bank. 1994. *Enhancing women's participation in economic development*, World Bank: Washington DC

World Bank.1995. 'Towards gender equality: The role of public policy', World Bank Discussion paper 292, World Bank: Washington DC

World Bank, 2001. *Engendering Development Through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources and Voice*, World Bank and Oxford University Press, Washington DC.

World Bank 2001b. Michael Bamberger, M Blackden, L Fort and V Manoukian

"Gender: Chapter 10" in *A Sourcebook for Poverty Reduction Strategies, Vol. 1: Core Techniques and Crosscutting Issues,* World Bank, Washington DC.

Young, I.M., 1990. *Justice and the politics of difference.* Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Annex 1

Elements of a political settlement through a gendered lens

Actors	Where are Women?	Actor's Interests	Do they include women's interests?	Institutions	Where are women in these institutions?/ do these institutions work to promote gender equity
Dominant elite coalitions that controls political and economic activity		Array of interests within elite circles that determine behavior and lead to the formation of coalitions		Arrangements that govern access to resources and control over violence, set parameters for competition	
Traditional elite	Generally men and not women; patriarchy and discrimination	Shared elite interest to maintain power	Including women seen by some leaders as important for maintaining power (women as vote Banks in Uganda)	Limits on violence	May enable women's participation in politics
Leadership of political parties	Usually not women, although South Asia seems to be an exception	Interest in excluding other elites	Generally excludes women and gender equity interests	Informal dispute resolution	Generally does not promote gender equity s but women may have specific rights; also spaces can be created
Senior officials in bureaucracy, military;	Generally not women; but there may be some through quotas (e.g. Bangladesh) and other measures etc	Interest of business elite to control market	Women generally are not business elites; and elite interests in business	Limits on access to resources	Rules can be changed for increasing women's access; but usually family laws, customary

			are seen as gender neutral		laws and market limits women's access to resources ; but women may have specific rights to assets
Powerful populist leaders	May appeal to women voters	Interest of narrow elite coalition to gain legitimacy	anti gender equity stance may be used to legitimize power	Rules of the game for political competition	Nature of the competition (violent) may limit women's participation
Business elite	Usually men and not women	Interest of elite for predatory behaviour		Informal institution (traditional norms)	Generally not a space where women can participate or is gender friendly; but spaces can be created
Senior levels of security establishment	Usually men and not women			Formal state agencies (police, judiciary etc)	Can act to promote gender equity or reinforce patriarchy; Can include women through quotas and other means

Adapted from Asia foundation (2010)

Annex 2

Case study analysis matrix for gendered policy processes

Actors	Interests	Governing institutions	Accountability failures	Outcomes reflecting gender equity and/or women's interests
Actors	Interests	Governing institutions		
Women's access and Presence	Is a gender equity agenda evident? Are women's interests represented?	Women's access, presence, influence		

Annex 3

Story of a successful transformation of policy process (women's inclusion being translated into influence (political effectiveness): domestic violence legislation in South Africa (Meintjes 2003).

- Post apartheid era was a critical political moment that opened up space for civil society and marginalized groups to influence state social policy.
- Politics of gender was neglected in discourse of democratic transition, hence gender entered extremely adversarial policy arena, but general acceptance of the need for law reform.
- Many years of women's involvement in antiapartheid struggle resulted in strategic political mobilization during the negotiation process.
- Broader political women's movement in a policy coalition included NGOs working on VAW, international organizations and UN instruments like CEDAW, and feminist academics and activists.
- Key champions of women's issues in parliament and institutions and in state bureaucracies, in particular male supporters.
- Women's needs and interests became public policy issues.
- Women activists built upon earlier activism of the 1970s and 1980s to ensure that a new set of political interests were inserted into the state's political and policy agenda.

Annex 4

Empirical cases of women's participation and representation in political institutions and processes and women's movement

Study	Sample Description, study period, methodology	Summary of findings/ Key argument on gendered politics
Agarwal, B. (2002)	Comparative study between Nepal and India at 87 community sites. Supplemented by earlier case study research Data collected during 1989-1999. Information collected through unstructured interviews with villagers, community forestry groups, and key informants.	This chapter examines community forestry groups that are set up by the state. It shows that while these groups appear participatory and equitable it hides gender inequities and inefficiencies. It shows how group functioning are determined by rules, norms and perceptions and also household and personal endowment all of which can work against the women.
Agarwal, B (2011)	Based on data collected from 1998-199; 2000-2001. Methods used were large scale surveys, interviews with forest group members, government officials etc and extensive documents reviews both in Nepal and India.	This book focuses on whether and how women's presence change governance processes of forest management. Using statistics it shows how women and men interpret needs and usage of forest is different. It also focuses on how to strengthen women's presence and what state, civil society and others can do.
Ahikire, J. (2003)	The chapter is based on the study of two districts in Uganda, one in eastern region and the other is south western Uganda. Interviews, group discussion and secondary data analysis were used to collected data. Data collection period was not mentioned.	The chapter focuses on contradictory impact created by the space provided for women in local government. Women have limited capacity (lack of experience) and also lack legitimacy. However support from CSOs, esp. women's association and technical support to local administration for ensuring women's effective participation may play critical roles in transforming the local government system.
Al-Sharmani, M (forthcoming)	The book includes country cases on: Brazil, Morocco, Bangladesh, Egypt, Palestine. Data in these chapters were collected through: interviews with feminist activists, lawyers, plaintiffs and judges, and participant observations of	This volume focuses on two areas of feminist legal activism: family (Muslim family law) and domestic violence laws. Some of the cases focus on movement building strategies and negotiations with the state for legal reform

	courts, and secondary material analysis. Data collection time varies between 1990s to last decade.	and the limitations of these strategies. Two of the cases focus on monitoring legal reform implementations and the how these are interpreted by different actors and the gains and losses for women.
Araujo, C (2010)	Statistical analysis and regression are the key methods. Data collected by author in six political parties since 1996.	The paper argues that the quota system in Brazil is not working with women candidates hitting a ceiling of competition, i.e, fewer women being elected. Male resistance is not the only reason but lack of legal sanctions, vagueness around the quota law and elitist nature of Brazilian politics all contributed to towards creating the 'ceiling of competition.'
Beaman, et al. (2008)	Data collected in West Bengal, India in 2006/7 from 495 villages spread across 195 grma panchayat. Villages were randomly selected with surveys carried out on 15 individual and households on public goods provision, and implicit association tests.	The paper investigates public attitude towards female leaders in villages where there were no previous requirements to have female leaders. The study found that having a female leader does not reduce the preference for a male leader but the gender stereotypes weakens and reduces biases towards female leader's effectiveness.
Basu, A. (1995)	Cases from South Asia, Latin America, Central America, Europe, East Asia and Middle east. The chapters were written by feminists who interviewed fellow activists, held focused group discussions and did secondary analysis. Time frame for collecting data was early 1990s.	The book focuses on how women's movement has changed worldwide, what issues women have mobilized around, particularly in the developing countries and its relationship with the political parties, state and other social movements, and transnational influences. The book shows there are regional similarities across movement in different countries. The Latin American movement has close connection with democratization movements against authoritarian states; In Africa and Middle East women's movement are intertwined with state consolidation process and

		national liberation. Other regions have more diversity. The book's analysis also shows that the developing countries experience of the movement and the activities they engage in includes a more diverse array of actors compared to the developed world.
Basu, A (2010)	Country cases from South Asia, Middle East, Latin America, America, East Asia. The chapters are follow up to the 1995 book written by different authors and they used different methods. It focuses on the decade of 2000.	The book sums up the challenges faced by feminist movement and its successes. The challenges listed ate NGOisation, rise of conservative forces, dilution of feminist political ideals post democratization, fragmentation of the movement. It details various how feminists have used different strategies to promote their cause.
Burnet, J. (2008)	Based on ethnographic research conducted in urban and rural Rwanda in 1997 and 2007, including over 100 interviews with political leaders and members of CSO and documentary research conducted in 1996.	The article argues that the various affirmative action measures have increased women's participation in the short term. However, women's ability to influence legislation or policy has decreased over time. In the long term this may change as women's political subjectivity changes and also if the political context changes from an authoritarian one.
Chattopadhay, R. and Duflo, E. (2004)	The study randomly selected 265 village councils in Rajasthan and West Bengal to analyze local public goods provision.	The study explores local public goods provision in reserved and un reserved councils. It shows that the pattern of investment in infrastructure has strong relevance to gender. The results show that female headed village councils are more receptive to women's interests and needs compared to male headed councils.
Chowdhury, N. (1994)	A collection of chapters, where authors collected data using interviews with politicians, women representatives, women in local government and academics in Bangladesh. Secondary document analysis. Data collected in 1994.	The chapters show that despite two women being leaders of the two major parties, the political parties remain gendered. The quota systems have made women visible but have not created legitimacy of women representatives. The political party agenda on women's

		issues have an instrumental focus, only the Islamic party has a comprehensive plan around gender issues.
Cornwall, A. and Coleho, V. (2007)	The book contains cases from Brazil, India, Angola, Bangladesh, UK, Canada, Argentina. Data collected for cases based on interviews, group's discussions, observation etc. Study period of these cases varied between	The cases explore whether institutional spaces for participation created through legal means or technical apparatus are really spaces for change through increased citizenship and inclusion. It examines the micropolitics in these spaces. Cases show that changes are incremental, that there is a growing sense of entitlement and slow shift towards political agency through participation. It also argues well co-ordinated legal framework and policies, committed bureaucrats, articulate social actors and inclusive institutional design expands access of the marginalized to these spaces but not influence. It also stresses that more attention needs to be paid in research on contingencies of political culture.
Fester, G (forthcoming)	Interviews and observation and own experience as a government official and activist. Data discussed in this paper is from 1990 to last decade.	The chapter argues that feminist voice in South Africa had become fragmented because of the movement's failure to widely represent and accommodate interests across race/class and other divides. It also shows the strong links that created the national gender machineries and initial successes achieved by these gender mechanisms are facing various challenges and the feminist failure to tackle these.
Frohman and Valdez	The chapter focuses on episodes of struggle, women's movement for the vote, women's participation in anti-authoritarian movement, and women's activism in the	The study explores how different political opportunity structures created space for women to push their agenda. How solidarity and alliances were created by women with

	democratic era. Uses historical analysis, document analysis.	different group and how their participation in democratic movements created political legitimacy for women's issues being included in the public debate.
Goetz, A.M. (1997b)	Data collected in 1993 in Bangladesh. A comparative study of one government and one NGO program. Interviews with 121 field staff, and group discussion with workers, and secondary data analysis.	The chapter examines the gender differences in practice and perceptions of frontline workers of credit programs. It argues that structural differences of the NGO and the government programs are significant (but less so than expected) in ensuring receptivity to needs and interests of poor women. Factors such as gender and class hierarchies influence receptivity to women's interests greatly.
Gotez, A.M. (2003a)	This chapter is based on in depth interviews with 10 MPs, 10 local government councilors, six activists from political parties, six women's rights activists, and six representatives of development agencies, and group's discussions with local councilors in Uganda. The data were collected between 1998 and 2000.	The chapter argues that women's movement relied heavily upon the goodwill and positive protection of Museveni and NRM. NRM promoted a large number of women into national politics. The suspension of party competition and reservations for women has freed women from the need to secure political party backing in a context which is hostile to women's participation. On the other hand the nature of women's institutionalization into politic, esp. its reliance on NRM has reduced their legitimacy and effectiveness.
Goetz, A.M. and Hassim, S. (2003)	Compares Uganda and South Africa based on six chapters on different issues. The chapters collected data using interviews, group discussion, secondary data analysis. Data collection period three years.	This chapter focuses on the importance of politics: political party regimes, party systems, affirmative action measures and compares the impact of an increase in women's presence In politics in Uganda and Africa through this lens.
Goetz. A.M. (2003b)	This is a review of different bodies of literature on women's representation, women in political parties etc. The cases covered here are largely from developing	This chapter represents a framework for analyzing women's political effectiveness. It argues that gender equity interest promotion in policy making

	country context: Brazil, Argentina, Chile, India, Uganda, South Africa etc.	relies on three major factors and their interactions: the nature of civil society, the nature of political system and the nature and power of the state.
Goetz, A.M. and Nyamu-Musembi, C. (2008)	Review of literature on women's representation, collective action and voice.	The review focuses on women's participation and inclusion in formal politics, women's collective action and their impact on women's public voice.
Hasle, L. (2003)	Research conducted in 2002 in one district of Bangladesh, assessing the work of an NGO. Research based on analysis of 40 cases and interviews with the plaintiff, NGO staff and key informants	The study argues that NGO modified dispute resolution works because it is a preferred channel compared to the formal justice system. The inclusion of women in the committees and also accessibility has allowed to women bring forward their grievances. However the quality of verdicts reveals that gendered norms and biases prevail in the system.
Hassim, S. (2003)	The chapter is based on 10 interviews conducted between 1999 and 2001 with women parliamentarians. The author also attended /chaired workshops , seminars and discussions involving women MPs and CSO activists.	This chapter analyses the South African success story in brining women into national politics. The chapter shows that the closeness between women's movement and the ANC played a key role in this process. The chapter also shows how different levels of internal democracy within parties have affected women's chances in gaining access to decision-making within the party and chances for standing elections. The chapter also shows that even if there is democratic ethos within the party democratic centralism can erode ability of the feminists to question gender biased policies.
Hossain, N. (2007)	The paper is based on secondary literature review of empirical studies on VGD, program literature and stakeholder interviews. Data collection period not mentioned.	This study shows that the vulnerable group development program which targets poor women works because to a large part it works within the existing political interests and imperatives. The program allows the local elite to

		address the needs of the poorest so they are able to continuously rebuild their political capital. At the same time the local nature of selection of beneficiaries leaves it open to scrutiny which allows program partners and the community to create pressure on the elites.
Hossain , N. and Akhter, S. (2011)	Interviews with women Upzilla Vice chairs, male members, and chairpersons of Upzilla, interview with government official and experts in Bangladesh. Study period is early 2011.	This paper examines the new political space and the opportunities and limitations faced by women who entered these spaces. The key obstacle women face is lack of resources and gendered nature of functionings of the Upzilla. However many women have considerable networks with CSOs and mandate from top may change the situation.
Htun, M. (2004)	Case studies focus on France, India and Peru. Data was collected from IDEA (2003), electionworld (2003) and Parline in (2003). Also consulted government websites, secondary literature.	Htun focuses on how gender and ethnic identities intersect with partisan cleavages. She argues that quotas work for groups whose boundaries cross cut partisan divisions, such as gender. Reservations on the other hand are useful for formation of group specific parties, and suit groups whose boundaries coincide with political cleavages.
Htun, M. (2005)	The paper uses large scale survey data collected by George town university and also the latinombarometero polls, and other secondary document analysis. The time period is from the decade of 1990s and 2000.	This paper focuses on how political systems and electoral systems shape women's opportunities for political representation and uses Latin American countries as case studies. It argues that PR systems with closed lists increase chances of women being elected especially if there are placement mandates. It also points out that quota laws need to be drafted carefully as the loopholes allow political parties to skirt around the agenda. It also points out that sexist attitude towards women in power had yet to change, as most prefer male leaders and the link between women's

		descriptive and substantive representation is fragile.
John, M (2007)	Study conducted in municipalities of Delhi and Bangalore in 2002/3 through interviews.	The study explores the experience of women council members in urban areas. The paper shows many housewives have been elected to these seats and their families support have been crucial for them to run for office. It also raises complex questions about proxy representation, which as women discuss their experience shows has many layers. It also questions whether any automatic connection can be drawn based on as women enter these spaces they would promote women's issues. Most of the representatives are reluctant to be identified as representatives of women's interests, and vote based on personal interests and party line. Although they do come together when there is a crisis, such as cases of extreme violence.
Kardam, N. (1997)	This chapter is based on three cases, the World Bank, UNDP and Ford Foundation. Data collection period not mentioned.	The chapter provides framework for situating gender interests in an intra and inter organizational context. She argues that gender politics and institutional incentives operate in three contexts: political, organizational and cognitive. She discusses how interactions between these different contexts: political (commitment of stakeholder, state-society relations); organizational (decentralization, conflicting objectives of the stakeholders, organizational procedures and incentive structures, internal advocacy); and cognitive (discourse on gender) affect incentive structure of the

		development organizations.
Kemp, A. et al. (1995)	This is based on a small survey, three regional focus group discussion with women's movement activists, NGO workers, policy makers etc. Data was collected in 1994-1995. It uses as case studies the Rural Women's Group and WNC.	The paper focuses on new South African feminism in the post Apartheid era. It explores this through two case studies: the Rural Women's Group and the Women's National Congress. It analyzes the strategies used by these groups to contain traditional authorities, create space in politics and policy spaces and the challenges that are emerging for women's movement around tackling race, class and other issues.
Lamas, et al.(1995)	This study interviewed 21 women and men from women's activist groups, NGOs, policy makers and various grassroots groups. It also used document analysis. Data collected in 1994/5	The study explores how women's movement in Mexico created relationship and alliances with other social groups to promote gender equity concerns. It also charts how the opportunities for the women's movement to push their agenda changed as the political opportunity structures changed in the 1970s, 1980s and 1990s.
Macpherson, E. (2008)	Secondary literature review Focusing on India, Brazil and Mexico.	This article shows that viewing individuals and households as undifferentiated units create difficulties in analyzing accountability relations. Women have unequal power in the household and at the community level which restricts their agency. This article argues women's groups at the local level can be effective for ensuring responsiveness to gender needs and interests.
Mahmud, S. (2007)	This chapter is based on research on seven community groups located in Upzilas in three different regions (Pabna, Madaripur and Chittagong) of Bangladesh. Data collected through interviews with 49 community group members, 92 users and 61 non users of health services residents within the locality, and health care personnel at the local level. Case studies of health	The study shows that support: institutional, monetary and official recognition is critical for effective participation by people. Community mobilization is critical for creating legitimacy of the invited spaces. People's experience of participation in other spaces may enable then to participate better in these state created spaces. However, strong voice is

	watch groups was based on 53 interviews in four districts with health watch committee members, NGO workers, NGO staff at Head quarters.	meaningless there are no accountability mechanisms. Alliance of community representatives with managers of programs and administrators can ensure accountability.
Mansbridge, J (1999)	Study focuses on the US.	The article argues that descriptive representation can be advantageous in four contexts. In contexts where there is group mistrust and uncrystallized interests, better communication and experiential knowledge of the descriptive representatives improves the quality of deliberation. In contexts of historical and political subordination, descriptive representation creates social meaning about ability to voice concerns. These apply to women representatives in context where women where women's interests are unarticulated.
Mbatha, L. (2003)	Article is based on research in 2 local councils, both newly demarcated councils in 1993. One of them is an urban council the other in rural Guteng province. 9 in depth interviews with women councilors, two group discussions with men and women councilors, one to one in depth interviews with randomly selected women members in the constituency, and group interviews with women in the two communities (in total 40 interviews), data collected in 1999 to 2000. Also secondary sources such as annual report of the councils etc.	The chapter argues that the number of women in South Africa's local council is a reflection of the political parties, esp. ANC's willingness to break barriers cultural barriers. However women face different barriers to participation. They are less likely to occupy important posts, they face ridicule and distrust. Given their numbers are spread too thinly across committees to provide support to each other.
Mohanty, R (2007)	This study focuses on three villages in Rajasthan and explores three different types of programs. Data is collected through interviews with village women and men, key informant interview, participant observation and group	This chapter compared three different types of state-created spaces for women to engage in at the local level. It argues that the normative grounding of these spaces of participation is not enough to ensure women's effective

	discussion a. Data collection period not mentioned.	participation in these spaces. In fact, in contexts where institutions themselves reproduce stereotyped identities of and expectations for women, women experience different forms of humiliation and exclusion and these spaces remain 'empty.' Local bureaucrats and local organizations need to create supportive environment for women to participate.
Molyneux, M. (1985)	This takes Nicaragua as a case study. Data is collected through interviews, secondary documents analysis. Data collection period not mentioned.	This article focuses on how women's interests are affected by government policies aftermath a socialist revolution where women have participated in a mass scale. Women's interests are marginalized and subordinated to meeting other goals. It also argues that women's organizations need space and independence to pursue women's interests and have influence over party policies.
Molyneux, M. (2001)	This book is a collection of essays that focuses on Latin America. The countries include Argentina, Nicaragua, and Chile etc. Data were collected using ethnographic methods, interviews, secondary data analysis etc.	The book focuses on different Latin American feminist movements and how women's interests were negotiated with different actors. For example, in post revolutionary Nicaragua etc. In chapter six it provides categories for analyzing women's movement is different context and addresses the autonomy vs. integration debate.
Nazneen, S. and Sultan, M. (2010)	Interviews with the senior leaders of selected women's organizations, analysis of organizational documents, discussion with academics, workshops with the selected organizations. Data collection period 2008.	The article discusses how three national women's organizations used different strategies to promote women's interests. It argues that by packaging their demands strategically, creating coalitions, selectively targeting responsive part of the state and using personal networks these organizations were able

		to ensure effective response from the CSO and the state. However, the women's groups' failure to include these in the wider political agenda has limited their impact as actors in the political arena.
Nazneen, S. and Sultan, M. (forthcoming)	Cases from eight countries in the Middle East, South Asia, Sub Saharan Africa and Latin America. Each case written by scholar-activist based on their own experience, group discussions, interviews with other activists and key informants, and secondary data. The cases focus on the period between 1990 and last decade.	This introduction explores the opportunities experienced and the challenges faced by feminists in legitimising their voice in different contexts in the last two decades. These include: NGOisation, rise of conservative forces, creation of new democratic spaces, epistemic power of the donors etc. the strategies used by women's movement to package their demands, create wider alliances, use transnational links to place pressure on the state, constraining their opponents, and the impact of these strategies etc are discussed. It also discusses fragmentation of the movement in different contexts and the failure to accommodate marginalized groups.
Nazneen, S. and Tasneem, S. (2010)	Life histories of 20 women UP members, secondary document analysis, and digital story analysis. Study period between 2010 to 2011.	The article argues that the system of reserved seats with direct elections in the local government created legitimacy for women members. They have gained greater voice and social legitimacy in representing women's issues. However the centralized nature of the state, which makes local government a weak institution, and the gender biased culture may limit the transformatory potential of these changes
Pittman, A and Naciri, R (forthcoming)	The chapter uses interviews, observation of meeting, protests and policy processes. Focuses on decades of 1990 and 2000 and looks at Morocco, Lebanon.	This chapter explores the politics and dynamics of channeling voice through feminist nongovernmental organizations (NGO) to reform discriminatory nationality laws. Specifically, it examines the regional and domestic

		advocacy campaigns and collaborations in the Campaign to Reform Arab Women's Nationality with specific case examples of Moroccan, Lebanese, and regional campaign strategies. The findings underscore the way in which multiple feminist voices grounded in specific contextual realities have been leveraged to diversify and amplify campaign demands, highlighting the necessity of reforming unjust nationality laws. Ultimately, in aiming to deconstruct male privilege and legally secure women's autonomy and right to citizenship, fundamental notions of patriarchy are being challenged and rewritten.
Rai, S. (1997)	Interviews with 15 women MPs in 1994.	The chapter argues that the growth of women's movement has politicized gender successfully within the party system. However, party based institutionalizing policies impose significant restrictions on women organizing by themselves. It also argues that representative politics is one way of promoting women's interests that other avenues should be explored.
Randall, V. and Waylen, G. (1998)	This book covers both theoretical and empirical cases in Argentina, Russia, China, India, Vietnam, Uganda. The data used in these chapters are based on secondary literature, interviews, group discussions.	This chapter links gender, politics and the state and brings the state back into feminist analysis. It shows that state is not a monolithic category but a collection of agencies, discourses and institutions and all of this need to be taken into account while analyzing the state. It also shows how state constructs gender and that the role of the state regarding this varies in different contexts. Opportunities can be created at certain times and at times spaces may be closed off.

Randall, V. (1998)	This chapter discusses the findings from different country cases and tries to find common themes.	This chapter sums up the different essays in the book and shows that importance of political opportunity structures for women's participation. This chapter also discusses some of the ways this concept can be expanded taking into account contextual factors, levels and sites of politics.
Sagot, M (2010)	The article uses secondary document analysis and data.	The article explores the different process used in Costa Rica to increase women's descriptive representation. Author argues presence of unambiguous laws, strong presence of women's organizations to monitor implementation of the quotas helped to increase women's presence. However, increased presence did not necessarily translate into promotion of gender equity on public agenda
Sardenberg, C and A. Acosta (forthcoming)	This chapter uses statistical data, secondary document observation, interviews. Data collected for period from 1980s, 1990s, and 2000s. Data collected in 2009.	This chapter analyses the strategies and actors of the last four decades of the feminist and women's movements in Brazil; undertaking legislative reform and implementing public policies that benefit women. The feminist movement in Brazil has been influenced by the political developments such as the democratic struggles against the military regime and the restoration of democracy. The Brazilian feminist movement has strengthened its voice by working with other social movements and integrating their agenda into public policy and normative frames. The state emerged as an effective ally in the post authoritarian period which led to feminist involvement in changing the constitution in 1988. The chapter focuses on the processes at play in the formulation of the first and second Plans of Public

		Policies for Women argues that these processes have resulted in a revitalization of the movement by creating solidarity among the diverse feminist activists and the strengthening their voice.
Soares, V. et al (1995)	Based in discourse analysis, historical analysis , interviews and workshop. Data collected in 1995.	The constructs a history of Brazilian women's movement and struggle, particularly focusing on relationship between different women's groups and issue around race and class. It also looks at the role of the state and church and women's movement strategies for dealing with these actors.
Sultan, M (n.d)	Data collected in 2011, through interviews with top bureaucrats, mid level staff and frontline workers and document review of three government departments. The police, health and education department.	The paper details efforts undertaken by these departments to increase the presence of women, and inclusion of gender equity concerns into the program/ policies. While formal measure have been taken, the organizational culture limits women's effective participation.
Tadros, M. (2011)	Review of articles written on empirical country cases produced for Pathways RPC. Countries include Sierra Leone, Egypt, Ghana, Bangladesh, Costa Rics, Sudan, India.	This is a policy paper which contains several policy messages, taking an upside down approach, i.e., women politicians experience and entry into politics. Key findings include that for quotas to be effective the nature of political system and configuration of power among local political actors play a crucial role.
Tadros, M.(2010)	This introduction reflects on the country cases from South Asia, Latin America and Sub Saharan Africa. The cases used quantitative data sets, interviews, secondary document analysis etc for collecting data. Most of the data were collected in the last decade.	This article questions the effectiveness of quotas in increasing women's political effectiveness. It points out that while quotas have managed to increase numbers and visibility of women a closer analysis of the impact is required. Understanding who benefits from quotas, what gender agendas these women bring in, what kind of capacity development measures are

		used and their impact, the nature of the links between women and other CSOs, whether creation of male allies is possible all are key in making quotas work.
Tamale, S. (1999)	This book is based on PhD research on Uganda and women's representation from 1979 onwards completed in 1997. Data collection methods include interviews, group discussion, secondary data analysis	This research focuses the representative system created by Museveni government, the difficulties faced by women's representatives in having policy leverage.
Tamang, S. (2004)	Secondary document analysis and key informant interviews.	This article shows that the women's movement in Nepal since 1990s has pushed an overarching women in development agenda which excluded the diversity of women's interests in Nepal. The elites, women's movement leaders, NGO workers, the communist party all have been complicit in this silencing project.
Tripp, A.M (2001)	The paper uses secondary literature or statistical analysis.	This paper argues that given the change in political context, i.e., democratization, move toward multipartism, and creation of independent women's groups and NGOs, the nature of women's activism in SSA has changed significantly. It charts the women's participation in constitution making, anti corruption movement, legislative activism in Uganda, Malawi, Zambia, South Africa, Kenya etc
Tripp, A.M. (2003)	Data from 1990s and 2000. Uses statistics and secondary literature.	This paper focuses on SSA and how women's political representation has changed, and the experience of using gender quotas. It argues that the following factors gave rise to gender quotas: a) demand from women's movement; b) international women's movement and discourses on women in politics; c) symbolic appeal to women voters; d) using these for creating a new line of patronage.

Tripp, A.M. (2004)	Data collection method not mentioned. Secondary sources are extensive. 1990s and 2000s.	This paper focuses on how women's movement demand for land rights in Uganda and their reason for adopting a rights based approach and moving away from customary rights. It details strategies used by the land alliance to raise consciousness and make their case, the opposition it experienced inside the parliament and also from Museveni and the various other strategies women are pursuing to gain land.
Weldon, S.L. (2002)	Compares the impact of various modes of women's representation in 34 democratic countries on policy making in 1994.	It argues that women's movement and women's policy agencies may be effective avenues for expression of women's interests than women in the legislatures.
Waylen, G. (1996)	This book reviews secondary literature to analyze women's role, interactions and impact in third world politics.	The book focuses on gender issues in different contexts- colonial states, in revolutionary and post revolutionary context, under authoritarian regimes and also women's participation in movements in the transnational context. It shows the diversity of gender issues and nature of women's movement in the Third World that was not generally covered in the mainstream Western Feminist discourse on women's movement and also in the political science literature.
Waylen, G (1997)	The data collection method is not discussed in the chapter. The timeframe of analysis is Chile's authoritarian period and democratic transition	The chapter focuses on, SERNAM, the women' bureau which was established after the democratic transition. The chapter focuses on how much space and maneuverability exists within the state for women's movement. The bureau has been successful in pushing through narrow and specific issues, but in many cases its agenda for addressing gender equity concerns have been overtly

		challenges. It has also been plagued by lack of resources. The relationship with the women's movement is complex, though it was established to represent women's movement. There are questions around the representative nature of SERNAM.
UNIFEM (2008)	The report uses different bodies of research and data sets from all over the world.	This report focuses on accountability to women in politics, service delivery, justice systems, markets, and the aid industry. It analyses the different options that increases women's voice and choice for ensuring accountability.

Annex 5

Summary of empirical cases for analyzing gender equity in public policy processes in selected countries

Country and Study	Political economic context	Findings and conclusion
Integrating Gender into State Development Processes (mainstreaming)		
1. Bangladesh Goetz 1995	High levels of absolute poverty (80% in 1980s), very poor human development indicators; agriculture based economy, establishment of democracy after a decade of military rule, Women involved in political struggles and protests, including liberation war. 1990s, women's movement visible and articulate	WID Ministry and focal points in ministries, National women's development policy drafted with wide participation of women's groups, recruitment quota in civil service and in education and health sectors at local level, women's work included in official labour force definition
2. Uganda Goetz 1995 1990s	Military government during 1970s and 1980s when WID was framed as a liberal feminist agenda not of relevance to predominantly rural population. Women participated in National Guerilla Movement and later embraced within new social compact, women present in visible political roles	WID unit in Ministry of Planning and WID focal point in each Ministry, National Policy Statement on Gender Issues, gender training for senior civil servants, gender oriented development policy in each ministry. Strong collaboration of women's associations (women's finance and credit trust, women lawyers assoc) with WID Department
3. Chile Goetz 1995 1990s	Middle income, reasonably good human development indicators, reforms in 1973 following military coup, women's informal survival networks played critical role in downfall of military regime, but later excluded from elitist patron oriented party politics and the democratic decision making process, women have strong presence in civil society.	WID unit in ministry of planning, gender sensitive education and labour policy, gender disaggregated data, strong women's presence in civil society had influence in establishing WID unit
4. Morocco Goetz 1995 1990s	Middle income and reasonable good human development indicators, large increase in women's urban employment during 1980s and 1990s, Women's Bureau set up as early as 1941 within Ministry of Sport and Youth to support to women's income generating efforts on paternalistic welfare approach to WID, Women involved in anti-colonial struggle, but women's activism seem absent in policy space regarding this.	WID Unit since long in Ministry of Employment and Social Welfare Gender disaggregated data, some changes in Ministry of agriculture
5. India (Kerala) M S George 2006 Mid 1990s to early 2000	Strong move to decentralised planning since mid 1990s, Kerala placed higher than other Indian states in terms of human	Women Component Plan introduced in 1996 at local level as part of decentralized planning, mandatory 10% allocation of funds, increase in

	development indicators compared to its level of economic development, particularly wrt to indicators like sex ratios, female literacy, female health, but women still remain invisible in the public sphere, access to and control over resources, rights, and with respect to political participation, strong women's and left movements	participation of women representatives in sector plan, support from women's solidarity groups at grassroots
Country and Study	**Political economic context, period**	**Findings and conclusion**
Paid work and women's access to social rights and welfare entitlements		
1. S Korea Razavi 2007 From late 1990s	Military rule from 1960, democracy established in 1987, Development driven by strong nationalist sentiments, economic reforms and liberalization, rapid industrialization but wages kept low. State encourages children to support parents, caring responsibility upon women, codified system of male headship retained even after Family Law Reform in 1990, vibrant women's movement and civil society.	Move to contribution base social insurance, some safeguards through reforms in corporate governance to limit benefits in large firms, increase in coverage of social insurance schemes, state subsidies to compensate those with lower paying capacity likely to help women workers more, but gender wage gap highest in OECD countries in 1997
2. China Davin 2001 and Razavi 2007 From mid 1990s	State socialism with ethical commitment to emancipation of women, economic reforms in 1980s led to significant decline in share of state owned/controlled enterprise in gross industrial output; pre reform history of enterprise based social welfare (health, pensions, education, job security) which were most generous for state employees, less generous for employees in rural collectives, but coverage of women relative lower, repressed women's movement and civil society.	Rise in young rural women's access to employment, reflects escape from poverty and patriarchal control, shift to contribution based social insurance, women more likely to be excluded from social insurance since older women were more likely to be laid off from state enterprises, while young women more likely to be in temporary status and small firms.
3. Mexico Razavi 2007 From mid 1990s	Populist model of development by authoritarian welfare state, "dual regime" with significant coverage of education and health care, but less inclusive and stratified social security system, also gender coded. History of insurance based social welfare since 1940s. Promotion of industrialization through corporatist arrangements forged with peasants and industrial workers, strong indigenous movement, women's movement.	Rise in women's access to better protected employment in *maquilodoras* but decline in share of blue collar jobs, women in interior regions and smaller subcontracting firm not covered by social insurance schemes, women targeted in anti poverty programmes for performing maternal duties (child nutrition, school attendance) without regard for their own needs

4. India Ghosh 2001 From mid 1990s	Long history of democratic government, history of social security programmes based on welfare for most vulnerable groups, 1980s shift to equality and equity and targeted programmes and employment guarantees, reservation to political bodies, assistance to vulnerable women and girls, strong women's movement	Increase in young women's access to employment represents escape from poverty and patriarchal control, traditionally many schemes for social security but very poor coverage, limited coverage of workers in unorganized sectors including women and those outside labour market, social policy continues to be premised upon model of male head earning wages that that provide income for family, rise in women's paid work encourages recognition of women's unpaid work and led to greater social pressure for improvement of working conditions, but pressure to increase welfare entitlements and benefits carries risk of dampening demand
Reproductive health and rights in the context of health sector reform		
1. Egypt Khattab et al 2000 1995-2000	Military authoritarian rule, centralised planning, long standing recognition of population as grave development problem, projection of modern state with emphasis on women's socio economic development (women's literacy, employment, migration to urban areas) but demographic targets continue, high value placed on marriage and fertility, information on women's movement scanty, donor reliance for population programme	Establishment of high powered RH working group, but poor understanding of RH concept lacks holistic approach, poor quality of FP service, RH excluded from national insurance coverage, prohibition of abortion unless on grounds of mother's health, women's needs and interests are not central concern of implementation, NGO partnerships (training and research) and spaces for information dissemination and dialogue/debate among women researchers.
2. Indonesia Hull and Iskander 2000 1995-2000	Authoritarian rule under military leadership, political upheaval in 1965 overthrowing Sukarno regime and introduce New Order, family planning and population control high on development agenda, donor reliance for population centralized planning, programme, some voice of women's groups and NGOs about family planning programme	Targets in another name, limited access to sterilization and abortion, lowering of standards of medical care for FP services, authoritarian social mobilization for FP (Camps and safaris), centralized policy direction, strong government opposition to any discussion on non marital sex and sex education, little scope for independent action, even less for monitoring or criticism, outside the bureaucracy. But wide range of subsidized drugs and contraceptives available to married women
3. Mexico Palma and Palma 2000 1995-2000	See above	National Programme for RH 1996, seen as gender sensitive but demographic targets continue, FP seen as most powerful link between health and population policies, devolution of population planning and implementation of integrated RH

		services uneven because of differential and poor technical capacity at local levels, laws and standards created or modified to implement new RH programme (services for pregnant women, sexually transmitted diseases, prevention and control of HIV/AIDS, cervical cancer)
4. South Africa Klugman et al 2000 1995-2000	Fall of Apartheid marked radical change in approach to development (GEAR) of fiscal restraint, seen as one of the most progressive countries in terms of policy, but rule bound ineffective legacy of bureaucracy, new leadership with little experience of planning, drive towards rights and equity in health policy, high level of government transparency, strong civil society and political participation of women	Women's Charter for Effective Equality 1994, white Paper on Population Policy finalized through seeking wide public opinion, sexual and reproductive rights and services understood as human rights, the Choice on Termination of Pregnancy Act 1996, Decentralization of primary health care service delivery to districts and pilots to test different models of integration of services. But Inadequate response to HIV/Aids due to preoccupation with restructuring, over influence of donors in some areas (adolescent specific services, adolescent sexual health)
5. Tanzania Bangser 2000 1995-2000	History of colonial rule, remarkable achievements in standards of health and education post independence compared to other SSA countries, overwhelming debt burden following oil crisis of late 1970s, resource scarcity for social policy, health sector SWAP, strong women's organization	Severe cuts in social sector spending due to oil crisis with allegations that donor aid diverted from poverty reduction to debt financing mid 1990s, SWAP imposed user fees on services for STDs reduced attendance at clinics relatively more for women than men, RH addressed in fragmented manner by donors and government providers, not integrated into basic health care (history of vertical funding by donors), District managers have limited technical and implementation capacity, restrictions on legal abortion, RH and rights marginalized by leading women's organizations

The Effective States and Inclusive Development Research Centre

The Effective States and Inclusive Development Research Centre (ESID) aims to improve the use of governance research evidence in decision-making. Our key focus is on the role of state effectiveness and elite commitment in achieving inclusive development and social justice.

ESID is a partnership of highly reputed research and policy institutes based in Africa, Asia, Europe and North America. The lead institution is the University of Manchester.

The other founding institutional partners are:

• BRAC Development Institute, BRAC University, Dhaka

• Institute for Economic Growth, Delhi

• Department of Political and Administrative Studies, University of Malawi, Zomba

• Center for Democratic Development, Accra

• Centre for International Development, Harvard University, Boston

In addition to its institutional partners, ESID has established a network of leading research collaborators and policy/uptake experts.